INDEXING ART INFORMATION: Using the Getty Vocabularies

Patricia Harpring
Managing Editor, Getty Vocabulary Program

Revised June 2016
## Table of Contents

- **What are the Getty vocabularies?** .. 4
  - AAT .....17
  - ULAN .....18
  - TGN .....19
  - CONA .....20
  - IA .....21
- **Brief overview of indexing** ..... 22
  - Key points .....23
  - Thesaural structure .....26
  - Core information .....28
- **Indexing in more detail** ..... 31
  - Display vs indexing ..... 32
- **Controlled vocabularies vs controlled format** ....35
- **Which vocabularies are used for indexing** ....39
- **Specificity and exhaustivity** .....42
  - Specificity in various fields .....43
  - Exhaustivity in various fields .....65
  - Precoordination and post-coordination .....78
- **Uncertainty and ambiguity** .....83
- **Other issues for indexing** .....90
- **Unknown and undetermined** .....101
- **Knowable vs unknowable** .....103
- **Sample scenarios** .....111
Preface

• This presentation is a brief overview of general issues surrounding the indexing of art information.

• It includes examples of how to use the Getty vocabularies to index various fields, as well as indexing issues surrounding fields not linked to the Getty vocabularies.

• Examples of work records for illustration purposes may derive from CONA, which is an implementation of CDWA and CCO.

• For detailed and extensive guidance concerning these issues, in a field-by-field discussion, see CDWA, CCO, and especially the CONA Editorial Guidelines, which contain the most detailed instruction:

http://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/guidelines/index.html#cona
What Are the Getty Vocabularies?
What are controlled vocabularies?

- A controlled vocabulary is an organized arrangement of words and phrases
- Typically includes preferred and variant terms
- Has a defined scope or describes a specific domain

Purpose of Controlled Vocabularies

- To provide terminology to catalog and retrieve information
  - To capture the richness of variant terms
  - For some users, to promote consistency in assignment of the same terms to similar content
  - In retrieval, to utilize variants and broader/narrower contexts
Why vocabularies?

• Getty vocabularies gather related terms, other information, and links to improve access to information about art and other cultural heritage materials

• Used for indexing, retrieval, knowledge bases

stained glass
pot-metal glass
rose window
Catherine wheel

lancets
Medieval
Gothic
tracery
bar tracery
The Getty Vocabularies enabling digital art history

- **Art & Architecture Thesaurus ®**
  AAT = terms for generic concepts, relationships, other data
  - (e.g., watercolors, 玉器, amphora, asa-no-ha-toji)

- **Getty Thesaurus of Geographic Names ®**
  TGN = names for administrative, physical places, relationships, historical information, coordinates, other data
  - (e.g., Diospolis, Acalán, Ottoman Empire, Ganges River)

- **Union List of Artist Names ®**
  ULAN = names for people, corporate bodies, biography, relationships, other data
  - (e.g., Christopher Wren, Altobelli & Molins, Anp’yŏng Taegun)

- **[Cultural Objects Name Authority ®]**
  CONA = not only titles/names of art and architecture
  - (e.g., Mona Lisa, Livre de la Chasse, Chayasomesvara Temple)
  - In development: CONA links rich metadata for works to allow a conduit for research and discovery in the broader, ever expanding arena of digital art history

- **[Getty Iconography Authority]**
  - (e.g., Adoration of the Magi, Zeus, French Revolution, Der Ring des Nibelungen, Reclining Buddha)
  - In development: Now a module of CONA, includes names for iconographical narratives, religious or fictional characters, historical events, names of literary works and performing arts

The Getty Vocabularies

What are the Getty vocabularies?

- Catherine wheel or rose window? Thebes or Diospolis? Giovanni da Bologna or Giambologna? Mona Lisa or La Gioconda? Reclining Buddha or Bouddha couché or 涅槃仏?

- The AAT, TGN, and ULAN contain multilingual terminology and other related data to describe
  - visual art, architecture, other cultural heritage works, art history, conservation, archaeology, archival materials, visual surrogates, and related bibliographic materials
What are the Getty vocabularies?

- *Catherine wheel* or *rose window?* Thebes or Diospolis? Giovanni da Bologna or Giambologna? *Mona Lisa* or *La Gioconda?* Reclining Buddha or Bouddha couché or 涅槃仏?

- **In development:** CONA is linked to AAT, TGN, and ULAN

- CONA is a resource that compiles titles, attributions, depicted subjects, and other metadata about works of art, architecture, and cultural heritage, both extant and historical. Metadata is gathered or linked from museum collections, special collections, archives, libraries, scholarly research, and other sources

- Through rich metadata and links, it is hoped that CONA will provide a powerful conduit for research and discovery for digital art history and related disciplines
The Getty Vocabularies

Discover, link, access, retrieve, research, catalogue, index
Explore art, architecture, cultural heritage, conservation, archaeology, and beyond

What are the Getty vocabularies?

- *Catherine wheel* or *rose window? Thebes or Diospolis? Giovanni da Bologna or Giambologna? Mona Lisa or La Gioconda? Reclining Buddha or Bouddha couché or 涅槃仏？*

- **In development:** Getty Iconography Authority (IA)
  - The IA is a thesaurus that compiles names and other information for subjects of works of art that are not covered by the other Getty vocabularies
  - The IA includes proper names of iconographical themes or narratives, fictional or legendary people and places, named historical and legendary events, and named literary works or themes
  - The IA links to AAT, TGN, ULAN, and CONA; links to Iconclass, LOC authorities, and other existing resources
The Getty Vocabularies

- History of the Getty Vocabularies
  - The AAT, ULAN, and TGN were begun in the mid-1980s
  - To meet the needs of the art museum, visual resources, archives, and art library communities
  - Authoritative vocabularies to aid in the indexing and retrieval of art information
  - CONA development began in 2004; IA development was part of CONA
  - The vocabularies are compiled through contributions from qualified and trained contributors (museums, art libraries, bibliographic indexing projects, national and international translation projects)
  - AAT, ULAN, TGN, CONA, and IA have same core data structure and same core editorial rules
  - We (Vocabulary Program and technical team) provide instruction for use of and contribution to the Getty vocabularies at conferences and in online training materials
The Getty Vocabularies

Discover, link, access, retrieve, research, catalogue, index
Explore art, architecture, cultural heritage, conservation, archaeology, and beyond

- Getty vocabularies are valued as authoritative
  - Grow through contributions from experts
  - Contributors and published sources are cited
- Compiled, merged, edited, and published by the Getty Vocabulary Program and our technical team; refreshed every two weeks
- Data is made available in various ways: via online searching; Web services APIs; licensed relational tables and XML format annual releases [will be discontinued]
  - Now as Linked Open Data: structured and published to make it openly accessible and shareable on the Semantic Web
  - Open Data Commons Attribution License (ODC-By) v1.0
  - More open license, allows sharing, creation, adaptation of data with attribution
The Getty Vocabularies

Discover, link, access, retrieve, research, catalogue, index
Explore art, architecture, cultural heritage, conservation, archaeology and beyond

Search Tools & Databases
- Primo Search
- Getty Research Portal
- Collection Inventories & Finding Aids
- Photo Archive
- Research Guides & Bibliographies
- Digital Collections
- Article & Research Databases
- Collecting & Provenance Research
- BHA & RILA
- Getty Vocabularies
  - Art & Architecture Thesaurus (AAT)®
  - Cultural Objects Name Authority (CONA)®
  - Getty Thesaurus of Geographic Names (TGN)®
  - Union List of Artist Names (ULAN)®
- Contribute
- Editorial Guidelines
- Getty Vocabularies as Linked Open Data
- Frequently Asked Questions
- Obtain the Getty Vocabularies

Gettys Vocabularies as Linked Open Data

The Getty vocabularies are constructed to allow their use in linked data. A project to publish them to the LOD (Linked Open Data) cloud is underway. The documents on this page contain news and presentations about releasing the Getty vocabularies as LOD. These materials are subject to frequent modification and addition.

- News and Status of the Project
- What Is LOD?
- Introduction to Getty Vocabularies as LOD (PDF, 3.8 MB, 45pp)
- List of External Advisors (PDF, 83KB, 7pp)

The AAT, TGN, and ULAN are now available as LOD. They are published under the Open Data Commons Attribution License (ODC-BY) 1.0.

Attention developers and programmers:
Technical documentation to assist in exploring the AAT, TGN, and ULAN data is available at the SPARQL endpoint at vocab.getty.edu

News and Status of the Project
Releasing the Getty vocabularies as Linked Open Data is part of the Getty's ongoing effort to make our knowledge resources freely available to all. Making the Getty
The Getty Vocabularies

Discover, link, access, retrieve, research, catalogue, index
Explore art, architecture, cultural heritage, conservation, archaeology, and beyond

- Getty vocabularies are **thesauri** compliant with national (NISO) and international (ISO) standards for thesaurus construction
- They are compliant with / map to other standards:
  - CDWA (Categories for the Description of Works of Art)
  - CCO (Cataloging Cultural Objects)
  - VRA Core (Visual Resources Association core categories)
  - LIDO (Lightweight Information Describing Objects)
  - etc.
The Getty Vocabularies

- Features that allow the Getty vocabularies to be used in cataloging, retrieval, and linking
  - Each Getty vocabulary record, each term, and other data are identified by unique numeric IDs (rather than relying solely on test matching)
  - Many other fields are controlled by lookup lists
  - The vocabularies are linked to each other
  - The vocabularies share a core data structure
What Is a Thesaurus?

- Thesaurus: A semantic network of unique concepts
- Thesauri may be monolingual or multilingual
- Thesauri may have the following three relationships:
  - Equivalence Relationships
  - Hierarchical Relationships
  - Associative Relationships

Objects Facet
- Furnishings and Equipment
- Containers
- <culinary containers>
- <vessels for serving / consuming food>

Objects Facet
- stirrup cups
- coaching glasses
- hunting glasses

Objects Facet
- sturzbechers
- Sturzbecher
- stortebekers

hierarchical

Associative

equivalence

rhyta
- rhyton
- rhytons
- rhea
- rheon
- rheons
- ritón

distinguished from
Sample record

**ID:** 300132869

**Terms:**
- bobbin lace (pref, en)
- bone lace (en)
- cushion lace (en)
- 梭心蕾絲 (zh)
- 線軸編織花邊 (zh)
- kloskant (nl)
- dentelle aux fuseaux (fr)
- encaje de bolillos (es)
- encaje de bolillo (es)
- Klöpelspitze (de)
- Klöppelspitzen (de)

**Associative Relationships**
requires ... lace pillows (<textile fabricating tools and equipment>...Objects Facet) [300132869]

**Hierarchical Relationships (poly)**
- Objects Facet
  - Visual & Verbal Communication
  - Visual Works
    - visual works (works)
      - <visual works by material>
      - needlework (visual works)
      - lace (needlework)
      - bobbin lace

**Note:** With "needle lace," one of two primary types of handmade lace. It is characterized by being made by ...

Chinese (traditional) ..... 與「針織蕾絲 (needle lace)」同為主要的手工蕾絲,其特色是以纏繞於線軸或梭心...

Dutch ..... Een van de twee belangrijkste soorten met de hand vervaardigde kant; 'naaldkant' is ...

German ..... Zusammen mit der "Nadelspitze" eine der wichtigsten...

Spanish ..... Junto a "encaje a aguja", uno de los dos tipos principales de ...

**Contributors:** VP, CHIN, AS, RKD, IfM-SMB-PK, CDPB-DIBAM

**Sources:** Earnshaw, Clabburn, Needleworker’s Dictionary (1976); Identification of Lace, 2d ed. (1984); Ginsburg, Illustrated History of Textiles (1991)
ULAN, the Union List of Artist Names®

Sample record

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID: 500115493</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Names:
- Dürer, Albrecht (pref, de, en)
- Albrecht Dürer
- Duerer, Albrecht (en)
- Durer, Albrecht (en)
- Dürrer, Alberto (it)
- Durerus, Albertus (la)
- Dürer, Albreht
- Djarer, Albrecht
- Dyurda, Albrecht
- Dîrès, Albrehts
- Alberto Duro Tedesco
- デューラー, アルブレヒト (ja)
- 阿尔布雷希特·丢勒 (zh)

### Nationalities:
- German (pref)
- Bavarian

### Roles:
- artist (preferred)
- painter
- printmaker
- engraver (printmaker)
- woodcutter
- draftsman
- illustrator
- designer
- mathematician
- theorist
- portraitist
- religious artist

### Birth and Death Places:
- Born: Nuremberg (Bavaria, Germany) (inhab place)
- Died: Nuremberg (Bavaria, Germany) (inhab place)

### Events:
- active: Nuremberg (Bavaria, Germany) (inhab pl)
- active: Venice (Veneto, Italy) (inhabited place)

### Associative Relationships:
- apprentice of Wolgemut, Michael; 1486 to 1489
- child of Dürer, Albrecht, the elder
- founder of ...Albrecht Dürer Workshop
- patron was ...Maximilian I, Holy Roman Emperor

### Gender: male

### Contributors:
- VP, JPGM, Avery, WCI, Prov, GRLPSC, BHA, CCA

### Sources:
- Bartrum, Albrecht Dürer and his Legacy (2002)
- Bénézit, Dictionnaire des Peintres (1976)
- Bartsch, Le peintre graveur.
### Sample record

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID: 7011179</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Names:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siena (it,en,es,fr,nl,de)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>σίενα (el)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siyeh (zh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>シエーナ (ja)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sienese (en-adj)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sien (h-en)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sena Julia (h-la)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanna (h)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saena (h)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Hierarchical Rel. (polyhierarchical)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>World (facet)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Europe (continent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Italy (nation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Tuscany (region)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Siena (province)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Siena (inhabited place)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World (facet)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Europe (continent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Italian Peninsula (peninsula)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Etruria (former confederation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... Siena (inhabited place)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical: Late Etruscan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Place Types</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>inhabited place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>archiepiscopal see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commune (administrative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>since 1125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cultural center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>university center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>world heritage site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Associative Rel.</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ally of Pisa (inhabited place) [7006082]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghibelline allies, 13th-14th centuries</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Place Types</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>inhabited place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>archiepiscopal see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commune (administrative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>since 1125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cultural center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>university center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>world heritage site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** Siena was founded as an Etruscan hill town; later was the Roman city of Sena Julia (3rd century BCE). It flourished under the Lombard kings (6th century CE) and was Medieval self-governing commune ...

**Contributors:** BHA, FDA, GRL, PSC, VP

CONA, the Cultural Objects Name Authority®

Sample record

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID: 700000141</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Titles/Names:</strong> Hagia Sophia (en, de, nl) Ayasofya (tr) Agía Σοφία (el) Agia Sofia Haghia Sophia Sainte-Sophie (fr) Santa Sofia (es) Santa Sofia (it) Sancta Sophia (la) Sancta Sapientia (la) Holy Wisdom (en) Saint Sophia (en) 聖蘇菲亞大教堂 (zh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work Types:</strong> church; mosque; museum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date:</strong> original structure dated from 4th century CE; present structure built 532-537 CE; rebuilt in 12th century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creators:</strong> Anthemios of Tralles (Byzantine architect, ca. 474-ca. 534) and Isidors of Meletus, the Elder (Byzantine architect, active mid-6th century); Patron: Justinian I (Byzantine emperor, ca. 482-565)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Built Work:** Hagia Sophia

**Associate Relationship**

depicted in: *View of the Hagia Sophia in Constantinople*; Eduard Hildebrand; watercolor; ca. 1852; Hermitage Museum (Saint Petersburg, Russia) [700008345] |
| **Location:** Istanbul (Marmara, Turkey) |
| **Address Note:** 41.008548°N; 28.97938°E |
| **Materials:** system bearing masonry, centralized plan; interior surfaces are sheathed with polychrome marble, porphyry, and mosaics |
| **Dimensions:** central dome: diameter 31 m (102 feet); height 56 m (184 feet) |
| **General Subject:** architecture
| **Specific Subject:** Holy Wisdom;
| **Religion/Mythology** |
| **Note:** Domed basilica was constructed by the Emperor Justinian; built Constantinopie in 6th century... |
| **Contributors:** Avery, BHA, FIA, VP
| **Sources:** Fleming, Penguin Dictionary of Architecture (1999); Herrin, Judith, Byzantium (2007); Maidstone, Hagia Sophia (2002); Theoharidou, Architecture of Hagia Sophia (1988); Xydís, Chancel Barrier of Hagia Sophia (1947) |

Images may be under additional copyright.
### Sample record

#### ID: 1000085

**Names:**
- Avalokiteshvara
- Avalokiteśvara
- अवलोकितेश्वर
- Spyan ras gzigs

**AAT links**
- role/characteristic is ... bodhisattva
- symbolic attribute is ... lotus
- culture/religion is ... Mahayana (Buddhism)
- culture/religion is ... Theravada (Buddhism)

**Associative Relationships**
- associated with .... Krishna (Hindu iconography)
- counterpart is .... Guanyin (Buddhist iconography)

**Note**
The bodhisattva of infinite compassion and mercy; embodies the compassion of all Buddhas. This bodhisattva is portrayed in different cultures as either female or male...

**Hierarchical Relationships**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top of the AAT hierarchies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legend, Religion, Mythology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddhist Iconography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddhist Characters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avalokiteshvara (Buddhist Iconography)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Contributors & sources**

- [VP] Encyclopedia Britannica Online (2002-)
- Bowker, Oxford Dictionary of World Religions (1997)
- Huntington, Art of Ancient India (1985)
- LC control no.: sh 85010492
Brief Overview of Indexing:

Indexing Important Information
How to Index: Key Points

- Display fields, descriptive notes, and other text fields are not access points for retrieval; they are free-text note fields.
- Therefore, if a cataloger mentions important information in such a note, in order to facilitate retrieval, it must be indexed in the appropriate controlled fields elsewhere in the record.
- Use controlled terminology (such as AAT, TGN, ULAN, the CONA IA, CONA work records).
- Or another controlled vocabulary such as Iconclass or Library of Congress Authorities.
- For some fields, controlled lists or controlled format is appropriate.
How to Index: Key Points

- When indexing, use the most specific term or value applicable to the field
- But the most specific value must be warranted by available source information
- Follow rules for dealing with ambiguous or uncertain information
- Keep in mind if the field displays to end users or if it is hidden, used only for retrieval
- Rules differ for fields that do not display
Include information only if known

How to Index: Key Points

• Catalogers should include information only when known
• Assign terms with appropriate specificity, based upon available information
• However, to not record a specific term, for example Work Type, if documentation does not support it
• If you are not certain of a specific work type, use a term about which you are certain
• Catalogers should not guess or make assumptions unless they have authoritative documentation
Sub-facets (called “hierarchies”) establish the context of the term
Guide terms in angled brackets

Work type: carte-de-visite
Thesaural structure

- Ideally, choose the term within the record that best indexes the object at hand, e.g., singular for a single item
- Some systems or local cataloging rules do not allow linking at the term level

Work type: carte-de-visite

cartes-de-visite (card photographs) (preferred, C, U, English-P, D, U, PN)
(fotografische kaarten) (Dutch-P, D, U, PN)
(photographies) (French-P, D, U, PN)
carte-de-visite (card photograph) (C, U, English, AD, U, SN)
(Dutch, AD, U, U)
cartes de visite (card photographs) (C, U, English, U, U, N)
card photographs (cartes-de-visite) (C, U, English, U, U, N)
carte-de-visite photographs (C, U, LC, English, U, U, N)
cartes de visite photographs (C, U, English, U, U, N)
sure cards (C, U, English, U, U, N)
Visitenkartenporträts (fotografische Abzüge) (C, U, German, D, PN)
Visitenkartenporträt (fotografischer Abzug) (C, U, German, A, D, SN)
tarjetas de visita (obra visual) (C, U, Spanish-P, D, U, PN)
tarjeta de visita (obra visual) (C, U, Spanish, AD, U, SN)
Required fields

Include Required “Core” Information

- Certain fields are required for every work record
- Include information for all of the core fields
- Based on CDWA/CCO, the categories and subcategories that are indicated as core
- Core = those elements that the international expert task force, representing various related disciplines, agreed were necessary to uniquely and unambiguously identify and describe a particular work of art or architecture, or group of works, and to allow research
### Required fields

**Required “Core” Information**

**What is a minimum record?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core elements</th>
<th>Required “Core” Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catalog Level</td>
<td><strong>[CONA ID 70000285]</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classification</td>
<td>Catalog Level: item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Type</td>
<td>Classification: paintings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Work Type: painting (visual work)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creator</td>
<td>scroll (information artifact)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation Date</td>
<td><strong>Title</strong>: Scene of Early Spring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td><strong>Creator</strong>: Guo Xi (Chinese painter, 1023 - ca.1085 CE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Location</td>
<td><strong>Creation Date</strong>: 1072 CE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dimensions</td>
<td><strong>General Subject</strong>: landscapes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials &amp; Techniques</td>
<td><strong>Specific</strong>: spring (season)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repository Number</td>
<td><strong>Current Location</strong>: National Palace Museum (Taipei, Taiwan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mat &amp; Tech</td>
<td><strong>Repository Number</strong>: 000053N0000000000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td><strong>Dimensions</strong>: 158.3 x 108.1 cm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index display data</td>
<td><strong>Index</strong>: ink</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Example from CONA, an implementation of CDWA/CCO
- For these elements, always include data when cataloging
- Index display data
Required fields: Also include optional fields when important

Creation numbers

CONA ID: 700008854 Catalog level: item
Classification: musical instruments Work Type: guitar
Title: Archtop Guitar
Date: 1993 Culture: American
Material: spruce, maple, ebony
Dimensions: W. 17 in. Chordophone-Lute-plucked-fretted
Location: Greenport (New York, United States) Type: creation
Current Location: Metropolitan Museum of Art (New York, New York) Accession Number:

Current Location: Metropolitan Museum of Art (New York, New York, USA)
Repository Number: 2012.246

Creation Numbers: model: Centura Deluxe; serial number: 1249
Discussion of Indexing in More Detail:

Methodology and Issues re. Indexing
Display vs. Indexing
What Is Information for Display?

• Art information databases should include information intended for display and information that is *indexed* using controlled vocabularies to facilitate efficient retrieval

• Information for display should be in a format and with syntax that is easily read and understood by users, includes appropriate nuance and ambiguity

• Display fields may be free-texts or concatenated from controlled, fielded data

• Display fields may contain all the nuances of language necessary to relay the uncertainty and ambiguity that are common in art information
What Is Indexed Information?

- Certain key elements of art information must be formatted (e.g., years for dates) or linked to vocabularies (e.g., AAT, TGN, ULAN, IA) to facilitate retrieval
- **Indexing** in this sense should be a conscious activity performed by knowledgeable catalogers
- Consider the retrieval implications of indexing terms
- Do not use an automated method that simply parses every word in a text intended for display into indexes
Controlled Vocabularies vs. Controlled Format

- **Controlled vocabularies** are organized sets of controlled terminology values (often with other information as well)
  - Links to Getty vocabularies; links to controlled lists

- **Controlled format** refers to rules concerning the allowable data types and formatting of information
  - Fields may have controlled format in addition to being linked to controlled vocabulary
  - Or the controlled format may exist in the absence of any finite controlled list of acceptable values
Example of indexed information

**Classification**  ceremonial objects  
**Work Type**  bi  
**Title**  Disc (Bi)

**Dimensions Display:**
- diameter: 8 1/4 inches (21 cm)  
  - indexing: **value:** 21  **unit:** centimeter  **type:** diameter

**Mat & Tech Display:**
- jade (nephrite)  
  - indexing: jade (rock) [AAT 300011119]  nephrite [AAT 300011120]

- Display vs indexing  
- Display for the end-user; indexing for access, using controlled vocabularies  
- Indexing is important for access  
- Display allows expression of uncertainty or ambiguity in a note for end-user  
- Or Display may be concatenated from controlled values
Controlled vocabulary: Controlled list or link to AAT?

- **Controlled list**: benefit = shorter list, higher accuracy for catalogers choosing terms
- Controlled list may be linked to AAT through behind-the-scenes mapping
- **Link to AAT**: A direct link to AAT provides cataloger with full AAT, useful when the number of possible terms is very large

**Classification**: ceremonial objects

**Work Type**: bi

**Title Disc (Bi)**

**Dimensions Display**:
- Diameter: 8 1/4 inches

**Mat & Tech Display**:
- **Jade (nephrite)**
  - **Indexing**: controlled term linked to Getty vocabulary

**Controlled vocabulary**:
- Controlled term from pick list
- Controlled list

---

Patricia Harpring © 2016 J. Paul Getty Trust. For educational purposes only. Do not distribute. Images may be under additional copyright.
### Which fields here are controlled format, which use controlled vocabulary?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Display</th>
<th>Materials/Techniques Display: egg-tempera paint with tooled gold-leaf halos on panel</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material Name</td>
<td>egg tempera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material Name</td>
<td>wood panel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technique Name</td>
<td>painting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Display</th>
<th>Dimensions Display: comprises 10 panels; overall: 280 x 215 x 17 cm (110 1/4 x 84 5/8 x 6 3/4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Extent</td>
<td>components</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>cm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>height</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>cm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>width</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>cm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>depth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Which vocabularies are used to index a work record

**Record Type:** item

**Classification:** prints and drawings

**Work Type:** drawing, rendering

**Title:** Bulto

**Creator Display:** rendered by Eldora P. Lorenzini (American, 1910-1993)

**Index:** Eldora P. Lorenzini (American, 1910-1993)

**Role:** rendered

**Materials display:** watercolor, pen, and ink on paper

**Index:** watercolor, pen, ink, graphite, laid paper

**Dimensions:** overall: 55.9 x 40.2 cm (22 x 15 13/16 in.)

**Value:** 55.9

**Unit:** cm

**Type:** height

**Value:** 40.2

**Unit:** cm

**Type:** width

**Creation Date:** 1938

**Start:** 1938

**End:** 1938

**Current Location:** National Gallery of Art (Washington, DC, USA)

**Repository number:** 1943.8.16638

**Creation Location:** Santa Fe (New Mexico, USA)

**General Subject:** another work, religion & mythology

**Specific Subject:**

- Bulto, Andrés Garcia
- sculpture, figures, bulto, farming, plow, oxen
- St. Isadore

**Description:** Isidore, the patron saint of farmers and protector of crops, was a farm laborer employed by a wealthy landowner near Santa Fe in the early twelfth century. According to legend, Isidore spent so many hours in prayer that he was in danger of falling behind with his farming chores. As a reward for his exceptional piety, divine intervention dispatched an angel to help Isidore. This miraculous event is the subject of an eighteenth-century New Mexican devotional sculpture, or bulto. The most important figure in a bulto’s composition was typically represented as the largest, sacred hierarchy triumphing over the angel, who in turn outranks the oxen, surpassing them in scale. Bultos such as this one were placed in both homes and churches to help enlist a saint’s intercession on behalf of a prayerful supplicant. This sculpture of St. Isidore rendered by Fray Andres Garcia. Unfortunately, the face of Saint Isidore has been repainted at least once or twice, and...
Issues for Indexing

- Indexing fields are intended for retrieval
- The following are examples of indexing fields:
  - Any field that contains a controlled number (e.g., Start Date) or values controlled by pick lists (e.g., Preferred / Non-preferred flag), controlled files (e.g., bibliographic sources), or links to controlled vocabularies (e.g., Location is linked to TGN)
- Consider retrieval issues when you assign terms and values to such fields
- Indexing fields may be visible or hidden from end users
- If the indexing field is visible to end users, do not use overly broad estimations that will be confusing or misleading
Issues for Indexing

Applying vocabularies

- Factors to consider in assigning indexing terms
  - specificity
  - exhaustivity
  - pre-coordination vs post-coordination
Specificity and Exhaustivity
Specificity

- **Specificity** refers to the degree of precision or granularity used (e.g., *campanile* rather *tower*)
- However, catalogers should use terms only as specific as warranted by authoritative sources
- With all indexing, it is better to be accurate and broad rather than incorrect and specific

- How precise are your indexing terms?
- “temples” or “wats”
- “photographs” or “daguerreotypes”
- Collection size
- Collection focus
- Expertise of cataloguers
- Expertise of users
Specificity

Materials and Techniques

- Free-text Materials and Techniques display and index using controlled terminology (AAT)
- Simple matching for display to AAT terms

CONA ID 700008574 Catalog Level: Item
Classification: paintings Work Type: miniature
Title: Sarah Anne Allen
Date: about 1842
Creator: Clarissa Peters Russell (American, 1809–1854 American)
Dimensions: 2 3/8 x 1 7/8 in.
Mat & Tech: Watercolor on ivory
Provenance: The artist; descended in family to Emily L. Clark, the sitter's daughter; to MFA, 1936, gift of Emily L. Clark.
Location: Museum of Fine Art (Boston, Massachusetts); 36.351
Credit Line: Gift of Miss Emily L. Clark

Display Mat & Tech: watercolor on ivory

Mat & Tech Indexing [AAT]:
- watercolor [AAT 300078925]
- ivory [AAT 300011857]
### Specificity

**CONA ID:** 700000178  
**Catalog Level:** item  
**Classification:** paintings  
**Work Type:** panel painting | altarpiece  
**Title:** Adoration of the Magi  
  Adorazione dei Magi (repository title)  
**Creator:** Bartolo di Fredi (Sienese painter, active by 1353, died 1410)  
**Creation Date:** ca. 1385; some scholars date it after 1395  
**General Subject:** religion and mythology | allegory | human figures  
**Specific:** Adoration of the Magi | Siena | horses | camels | Magi | Holy Family | Journey of the Magi | gold | frankincense | myrrh | king | deity | death  
**Current Location:** Pinacoteca Nazionale di Siena (Siena, Italy); Repository No. 104  
**Measurements:** 195 x 158 cm (76 x 61 5/8 inches)  
**Mat & Tech:** tempera on panel  
**Mat & Tech Index:** tempera panel  

**Contributors:** BHA VP CD PNS GRI-PA  
**Sources:** Pinacoteca Nazionale di Siena (2002-); Boucher and Fiorini, Magi Reconstructed (2012); Cole, Sienese Painting (1985); Freuler, Bartolo di Fredi (1994); Harpring, Bartolo di Fredi (1992)

- Index only to level of specificity known  
- What if your source information does not indicate the type of tempera?
Specificity

Hierarchy
<paint by composition or origin>
water-base paint

- tempera
  - casein paint
  - egg-oil tempera
  - egg <i>tempera</i>
  - gum tempera
  - oil tempera

<i>Scope Note for egg tempera:</i>
Tempera paint using egg as its vehicle, traditionally the yolk only, in other cases, the whole egg.

- You may link to the general “tempera”
- Perhaps “egg tempera” more accurately describes the medium; use only if documentation supports it
Specificity

Materials and Techniques: Role, flag

CONA ID 700000110  Catalog Level: item  Classification: architecture
Work Type: church
Title: North Christian Church  Preference: preferred
Creator Description: designed by Eero Saarinen (American, 1910-1961); posthumously, construction was supervised by firm of Eero Saarinen & Associates (American architectural firm, 1950-1961)
Current Location: Columbus (Indiana, United States)

Mat & Tech Display: hexagonal plan, concrete base, leaded copper spire, slate roof; welded steel buttresses support the roof and spire at the 6 axial corners

Mat & Tech: steel Flag: material
Mat & Tech: concrete Flag: material
Mat & Tech: slate Flag: material
Mat & Tech: hexagonal plan Flag: technique
Mat & Tech: buttressing Flag: technique

You may index technique or implements separately from materials
Materials and Techniques: Role, flag

*Mat & Tech: Display: black chalk with touches of red chalk in the face on ivory laid paper
Mat & Tech [AAT]: chalk
Role: medium
Flag: material

Mat & Tech [AAT]: laid paper
Role: support
Flag: material

You may further index the support separately from media using a Role.
Classification

- Classification categorizes a work in a broader scheme
- May vary depending upon the organization of the collection
- Classification is controlled by an extensible list
- For movable works provided by the repository

CONA ID 700000122
Classification

**Classification**
- decorative arts [Class ID 20425]
- furniture [Class ID 20635]

**Work Type:** rolltop desk [AAT 300121499]

Creator: David Roentgen (German, 1743–1807, active in Paris), with Pierre Gouthière and François Rémond
Creation Date: ca. 1785
General Subject: furnishings
Current Location: J. Paul Getty Museum (Los Angeles, California) ID: 72.DA.47
Dimensions: 66 1/4 x 61 3/8 x 35 3/16 inches
Mat & Tech: veneered with mahogany, with gilt bronze mounts | mahogany | veneer

Description:
This Neoclassical desk has a writing surface that can be pulled out, triggering a mechanism that automatically withdraws the roll top, thereby displaying drawers and pigeonholes ...
### Specificity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Work Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>broad</td>
<td>specific</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Work Type

- **Record Type**: item
- **Class**: photographs, American art
- **Work Type**: gelatin silver print
- **Title**: Panoramic Photograph of the White House, Washington, DC
- **Creator Display**: Haines Photography Co. (American, 19th-20th century)
- **Role**: photographers
- **Current Location**: Library of Congress (Washington, DC, USA)
- **Measurements**: 15.85 x 55.88 cm (6 1/4 x 22 inches)
- **Materials and Techniques**: gelatin silver print

Work type should indicate what the work is, with the greatest specificity warranted by sources.
### Specificity

**Classification = broad  Work Type = specific**

#### Work Type and Classification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification controlled, extensible list</th>
<th>Work Type is drawn from full AAT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21381 machines</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21382 vehicles / transportation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21391 minerals / rocks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21431 needlework / sewing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21465 numismatics / philately</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21485 natural history</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21667 paintings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21668 performance art / installations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21699 personal accessories</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21670 photographs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21672 prints</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Classification is drawn from an extensible list, mapped behind the scenes to one or more AAT terms
- Work Type is drawn directly from the full AAT, primarily terms in the Objects facet

---

`Top of the AAT hierarchies

.... Objects Facet

........ Visual and Verbal Communication (hierarchy name)

........... Visual Works (hierarchy name)

............ visual works (works)

................. <visual works by material or technique>

........................ photographs

............................... <photographs by form>

................................. positives (photographs)

................................ photographic prints

....................................... <photographic prints by process>

........................................ gelatin silver prints`
Specificity

Work Type: Homographs

- keys (hardware)
- keys (sound device components)
- keys (texts)

- Be sure to link to the correct concept
- Beware of homographs
- Homographs are distinguished by hierarchical placement and other information, an in AAT by “qualifier” which is stored in separate field from term

London Key Map Symbols:

- Motorway
- Primary Route
- A Road
- B Road
- Other Road
- Toll
- Street Market
- Postal District Boundary
- Main Railway Station
- Other Railway Station
- London Underground Station
- Decklands Light-Rail Station
- Bus/Coach Station
- Car Park
Specificity

Link to the term appropriate for indexing; singular or plural? which language?

Work Type: Plural, language

Catalog Level  item
Classification  vessels
Work Type  vase
Title  Blue and White Glazed Globular Vase
Creator  unknown Chinese
Creation Date  1403/1424 CE
Subject (general)  object (utilitarian)
(specific)  animal | dragon
Current Location  National Palace Museum (Taipei, Taiwan) ID: 012547N000000000
Measurements  42.9 cm high and 9.7 cm diameter; foot diameter 15.8 cm
Materials  blue and white porcelain | porcelain (material) | blue-and-white (ceramic glaze)

- Linking to the AAT and other Getty vocabularies allows the variant terms and other links and information in the AAT, ULAN, or TGN record to be used in retrieval of the work.
### Specificity
- It may be appropriate to link to historical names, if system allows it
- In this case, index the name as it appears inscribed on the work
- Through TGN, all other names are linked

### Location: Historical names

- **Firenze** *(preferred, vernacular, Italian-preferred)*
- **Florence** *(English-preferred)*
- **Florenz** *(German-preferred)*
- **Florencia** *(Spanish-preferred)*
- **Fiorenza** *(historical)*
  - **Date**: Medieval
  - **Start**: 900 **End**: 1700
- **Florentia** *(historical, Latin)*
  - **Date**: name of Roman colony on North bank of Arno
  - **Start**: -100 **End**: 1500
- **Florentine** *(adjectival, English)*

- Names and terms may be historical, may have dates

---

**CONA ID**: 700008891  
**Title**: Fiorenza: From Disegni delle più illustri città  
**Work Type**: xylograph  
**Creator**: D. Zenoi, published by Giulio Ballino  
**Date**: 1569  
**Location**: Venezia  
**Type**: publication  
**General Subject**: cityscape  
**Specific Subject**: Fiorenza [TGN]
Specificity

You may choose terms or names preferred by other vocabularies if you wish
E.g., LOC name is flagged in the ULAN record

ULAN names
Moore, Henry (preferred, index, LC)
Henry Moore (display)
Moore, Henry Spencer

LC Control Number: n 79018152

**HEADING:** Moore, Henry, 1898-1986

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LC</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>000</td>
<td>00967cz a2200253n 450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>001</td>
<td>4213247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>005</td>
<td>20060504162806 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>008</td>
<td>790305n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>010</td>
<td>a n 79018152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>035</td>
<td>a (DLC)n 79018152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>040</td>
<td>a DLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 400 | 1 | nanaa | a Moore, Henry Spencer, | d 1898-
**Specificity**

- **Current Location**
- Flag with extensible list of Types creation, discovery, original, architectural context
- Location may be a Repository (corporate body) linked to ULAN (in ULAN, the repository place is in turn linked to TGN)
- Location may be a Geographic Location linked to TGN

**Location:** Geographic, repository, flags for Type

- **CONA ID 700000153 Class:** Sculpture  
  *Work Type:* hacha
- **Title:** Hacha (Ceremonial Ax)
- **Creator Display:** unknown Veracruz
- **Creation Date:** Late Classic Veracruz (600-900 CE)
- **Current Location:** Dumbarton Oaks  (Washington DC, USA)  
  **ID:** B38 VCS

- **Current Location:**
  Dumbarton Oaks  (Washington, DC, USA)  
  [ULAN 500235090]
- **Repository Number:** B38 VCS
- **Location:** Veracruz (Mexico)  
  **Type:** discovery  
  [TGN 7005599]
Specificity

Subject: Several vocabularies

- Subject terms may be derived from various vocabularies
- Use the vocabulary having terms that best describe the subject

CONA ID: 700008509 Class: photographs
Work Type: photograph
Title: Lincoln on the Battlefield of Antietam
Creator: Alexander Gardner (American photographer, 1821-1882)
Date: 1862 Material: albumen print Dimensions: 8 5/8 x 7 3/4 inches

General
portraits
history and legend

Specific
Antietam National Battlefield
(Sharpsburg, Maryland, United States) . TGN
American Civil War (event) ........ IA
Abraham Lincoln (American president, 1809-1865) ........ ULAN
John McClernand (American Union General, 1812-1900) ........ ULAN
Allan Pinkerton (American Secret Service agent, detective, 1819-1884) . ULAN
army camp ........ AAT
tents (portable buildings) ........ AAT
Does your source name the species? pomegranate (Punica granatum)? Blue Morpho (Morpho menelaus)? Banded Sphinx Moth (Eumorph fasciatus) caterpillar? Do not include information if you are uncertain (e.g., “butterfly” or species Morpho menelaus)

May link to scientific or common name, as well as to plurals, singulars, languages as necessary.

Subject: Scientific, common name

General Subjects: animal • botanical
Specific Subjects:
- Morpho menelaus (species)
- Punica granatum (species)
- Eumorph fasciatus (species)
Specificity

“untitled”? Titles or names

CONA ID 700008563 Catalog Level: item
Classification: prints and drawings Work Type: screen print
Creation Date: 1965
Current Location: National Gallery of Art (Washington, DC); Gift of Roy and Dorothy Lichtenstein; 1996.56.139

**Title:** Brushstroke
**Title Type:** repository

Value: 58.4 Unit: cm Type: height
Value: 73.6 Unit: cm Type: width
Extent: image
Value: 56.4 Unit: cm Type: height
Value: 72.4 Unit: cm Type: width
Extent: framed
Value: 76.7 Unit: cm Type: height
Value: 92.2 Unit: cm Type: width
Value: 4.4 Unit: cm Type: depth
Mat & Tech: color screen print on heavy, white wove paper
Inscriptions: lower right in graphite: rf Lichtenstein H.C. G Leo Castelli Gallery

- Do not leave “core” fields blank
- Avoid using the term “untitled” as a Title unless it is so-named by the artist or by the owner/repository
- If no title is given, construct a descriptive title
- In this example, the repository has given the work a title
Specificity

Titles or names

Record Type: item • Class: prints and drawings • American art
*Work Type: • design drawing • competition drawing
*Title: Temple Design
for the Lincoln Memorial
Title Types: descriptive

**Title: Temple Design
for the Lincoln Memorial
Title Types: descriptive

- *Create Date: 1912 [controlled]
  - Earliest: 1912
  - Latest: 1912

*Subject [links]:
  - architecture
  - Lincoln Memorial (Washington, DC, USA)
elevation
  - Culture [link]: American
*Current Location [link]: National Archives and Record Administration (Washington, DC, USA) • ID: unavailable
*Measurements: unavailable
*Materials and Techniques: ink and watercolor on paper
  - Material [links]: • ink • watercolor • paper
  - Related Work:
  - Relationship Type [controlled]: depicts
  - [link to Work Record]: Lincoln Memorial (Washington, DC, USA);
    Henry Bacon (American architect, 1866-1924) and Daniel Chester French (American sculptor, 1850-1931), 1915-1922

- Do not leave “core” fields blank
- Avoid using the term “untitled” as a Title unless it is so-named by the artist or by the owner/repository
- If no title is given, construct a descriptive title
- In this example, title is constructed

*Title: Temple Design
for the Lincoln Memorial
Title Types: descriptive

- *Create Date: 1912 [controlled]
  - Earliest: 1912
  - Latest: 1912

*Subject [links]:
  - architecture
  - Lincoln Memorial (Washington, DC, USA)
elevation
  - Culture [link]: American
*Current Location [link]: National Archives and Record Administration (Washington, DC, USA) • ID: unavailable
*Measurements: unavailable
*Materials and Techniques: ink and watercolor on paper
  - Material [links]: • ink • watercolor • paper
  - Related Work:
  - Relationship Type [controlled]: depicts
  - [link to Work Record]: Lincoln Memorial (Washington, DC, USA);
    Henry Bacon (American architect, 1866-1924) and Daniel Chester French (American sculptor, 1850-1931), 1915-1922

- Do not leave “core” fields blank
- Avoid using the term “untitled” as a Title unless it is so-named by the artist or by the owner/repository
- If no title is given, construct a descriptive title
- In this example, title is constructed
Specificity

- Place information in the correct field
- E.g., an inscription is not necessarily a title
- Record long inscriptions in the Inscription field

Titles vs inscription

**CONA ID** 700000075  **Classification** prints and drawings

**Work Type** poster | lithograph

**Title:** Chat Noir

**Title:** Poster of a Black Cat, for the Reopening of the Chat Noir Cabaret

**Creator** Théophile-Alexandre Steinlen (Swiss artist, 1859-1923)

**Creation Date** 1896

**General Subject** advertising/commercial | animals

**Specific** domestic cat | Chat Noir (cabaret) | Rodolphe Salis (French performer, 1851-1897) | shadow theater

**Current Location** Santa Barbara Museum of Art (Santa Barbara, California): ID:1991.17

**Dimensions** 61.6 x 39.62 cm (24 1/4 x 15 5/8 inches)

**Mat & Tech:** lithograph | ink | paper | lithograph

**Inscription:** along right side and bottom: Prochainement / la très illustre Compagnie du / Chat / Noir / avec / ses Pièces d'Ombres / Célèbres, ses Poètes / ses Compositeurs / Avec / Rodolphe Salis
Specificity

Work type? or Shape?

CONA ID 700008629
Record Type: item
Class: • architecture • European art

**Work Type:** • entrance

**Title:** Pyramids: Entrance to the Louvre

**Creator Display:** I. M. Pei

**Current Location:** Louvre Museum Courtyard (Paris, France)

Role: architect Pei, I. M. (American, born 1917 in China)
Creation Date: 1989 • Start: 1989 • End: 1989

**General Subject:** architecture Type: isness Specific: museum entrance

**Dimensions:** 21.6 m (71 feet) pyramid
- **Value:** 21.6 **Unit:** m **Type:** height
- **Shape:** pyramidal

**Material & Tech:**
- glass and steel rods and cable

**Material [links]:** • glass • steel
**Technique [links]:** • cable

Part of: Louvre Palace (Paris, France) CONA ID 700008630

- Work Type is linked to AAT
- Be sure to use the correct term, noting hierarchy context and meaning of the term in AAT

- But is Work Type “pyramids” here?
- Not a tomb; geometric figure not a “work type”
- Better to use Work Type for function = “entrance”
- Form = pyramidal as Shape under Dimensions
**Specificity**

**Relative to catalog level**

**Group-Level or Item-Level cataloging?**

- **Approach A:** Describe/catalog only the broader work or group using general terms for the whole as well as important specific terms for the important parts or items.
- **Approach B:** Describe/catalog the broader work or group, knowing you intend to make separate records for all or the most important parts or items.
  -- For the broader work or group, use general terms applicable to all the parts
  -- For the parts or items, use terms specific for each

**Catalog levels**

- item
- volume
- group
- subgroup
- collection
- set
- series
- multiples
- component

- Museums primarily catalog items
- Special collections and archives catalog groups, volumes, etc.
- What is the catalog level of your work record?
- Specificity of terms may be determined by the level at which you catalog
- Different terms are relevant for different levels

---

**Subject:**
- psalms [AAT]
- antiphons [AAT]
- Isaiah (prophet, Old Testament) [IA]
- Book of Isaiah (9:2–7 Psalm 96) [IA]
- liturgical texts [AAT]
Specificity

Cataloging work or image?

- Requires separate records
- Object in hand, or the object depicted in the visual surrogate?
- Are you creating a record for the digital image or slide of the illumination? Or the work depicted?
Exhaustivity

- **Exhaustivity** refers to the degree of depth and breadth that the cataloger uses, often expressed by using a larger number of indexing terms or a more detailed description.

- However, is it useful to index every possible applicable term?

- If not, where do you draw the limit? Index the most important or most prevalent characteristics.

- How many aspects of a work do you catalog? How many terms do you assign to a work?

- Time limitations

- Focus of the collection
### Exhaustivity

**Record Type:** volume  
**Class:** books and manuscripts  
**Work Type:** gradual  
**Title:** Gradual for Monastic Use  
**Creator:** illumination: workshop of: Pacino di Bonaguida; patron: probably Augustinian  
**Creation Location:** Florence (Italy)  
**Creation Date:** 1303/1340  
**Style:** Gothic  
**Measurements:** 174 folios; overall (page dimensions): 35.7 x 26.2 cm (14 1/16 x 10 5/16 inches)  
**Materials:** tempera and ink on parchment; bindings of calfskin over boards with metal clasps  
**Current Location:** Museum of Fine Art (Boston, Massachusetts)  
**Description:** A gradual (a liturgical book, containing chants for the Mass) for monastic use, possibly the Augustinian order, with 174 folios (ff.) and 2 leaves:  
- ff. 1 - 109: Gradual: Temporale and Sanctorale (partial)  
- ff. 109v - 113: Litany  
- ff. 114 - 160: Gradual: Temporale (continued)  
- ff. 161 - 168: Temporale sequences  
- ff. 169v-174v: Credo (four repetitions of “Patrem omnipotentem,” each with a different melody)  

- How many aspects of a work do you catalog?  
- Only core fields, or do you need others?  
- How many terms do you assign to each field of a work record?
Exhaustivity

- Multiple terms may apply
- E.g., one work may require multiple work types

Class: Prints, Drawings, and Photographs
Work Type: Title: Birth and Baptismal Certificate
Creator: Francis Portzline (American (Pennsylvania German), active 1838 -1855)
Creation Location: Pennsylvania, United States
Creation Date: 1840/1855
Materials: watercolor wash, pigments in gum medium, and ink on wove paper
Measurements: sheet: 12 13/16 x 15 9/16 inches (32.5 x 39.5 cm)
Current Location: Pennsylvania Museum of Art

Description: The colorful drawings known today as fraktur (so called because of the “fractured” Gothic script employed) were created as blessings, rewards of merit, or personal records of confirmation, marriage, or baptism, as in this example. Like many fraktur artists, Francis Portzline taught school and had special skills in writing that are evident in the lettering on the certificate. The central image is an anykis or stylized heart that features the names of the church members, found in this example on a certificate for the birth of a child. The surrounding birds, butterflies, and flowers reinforce the celebratory nature of the religious ceremony. Such records were important for membership in the Lutheran or Reformed Churches; their texts also offered spiritual guidance for their owners.

Record Type: item
Class: *prints and drawings
- American art

Work Types:
- fraktur (document)
- birth certificate
- baptismal certificate
Exhaustivity

- Record Type: item
- Class: Manuscripts, Near Eastern works
- Work Types: manuscript, palimpsest, prayer book, homiliary

Title: MS 575. Codex Armenicus Rescriptus. Palimpsest. Creator: Unknown scribes, created at the Monastery of St. Catherine, Mt. Sinai, Egypt; Authors: Johannes Chrysostomus: Homilies on the Psalter; Parakletikon: Melkite Liturgical Prayers, Including a Tract on the Mobilitas Demon
Date of Creation: 6th century, 1st half of 10th century


Language: Text 1: (underlying text 6th century, Armenian; Text 2: (overlying text Syriac)


Description: The Codex Armenicus Rescriptus is a parchment originating at the Monastery of St. Catherine at Mt. Sinai. The original text on the parchment was an Armenian version of the Homilies on the Psalter by John Chrysostomos. It was later overwritten with Melkite liturgical prayers in Syria. The Armenian text dates from the 6th century, the golden age of the Armenian language. The Syriac text dates from the 10th century. Among the earliest texts of its kind, it is a significant contribution to the study of early Syriac literature.

Multiple terms may apply
- E.g., one work may require multiple work types

Work type may change over time
- Include terms for original and current type
- Was originally a set of homilies;
- second text is a prayer book
Exhaustivity

Group or item-level

Record Type: group
Class: architectural drawings
Title: Group: Drawings for Falling Water (Kaufman House), Bear Run, Pennsylvania
Creator: Frank Lloyd Wright

Work Types:
- preliminary drawings
- presentation drawings
- working drawings
- sections
- elevations
- plans

- Should terms reflect all items in the group?
- Or use broad terms ("drawings"), because you plan to use specific terms in records for each item?
Exhaustivity

- Item in hand, or conceptual work, or series?

- Whole/Part Records for a series and a part
Exhaustivity

CONA ID 700008520
Class: drawings Work Type: drawing
Title: Circular Monument for Lincoln
Maker: architect: Daniel H. Burnham; draftsman: C.B.
Date: 1908-1909
Location: United States Capitol collection (Washington, DC)

CONA ID 700008521
Class: drawings Work Type: drawing
Title: Temple design for the Lincoln Memorial
Maker: architect: Henry Bacon; draftsman: Jules Guéren
Date: 1912
Location: National Archives (Washington, DC)

CONA ID 700008522
Class: drawings Work Type: drawing
Title: Pyramid design for the Lincoln Memorial
Maker: architect: John Russell Pope; draftsman: attributed to Rockwell Kent
Date: 1912
Location: National Archives (Washington, DC)

CONA ID 700008523
Class: drawings Work Type: drawing
Title: Pyramid design for the Lincoln Memorial
Maker: architect: John Russell Pope; draftsman: attributed to Rockwell Kent
Date: 1912
Location: National Archives (Washington, DC)

Another conceptual relationship
Entries in an architectural competition may be considered a group (non-archival)
Link a drawing to the appropriate competition group through hierarchical relationships
[Record competitions as events in Events]

Lincoln Memorial (conceptual)
Lincoln Memorial [Structure as built]
Competition 1908-1909
Competition 1911-1912
Exhaustivity

Works are linked to each other

Hierarchical relationships

- In this case, are all the works in one cave considered a set or object grouping?
- Linked to the Caves Complex through associative relationships?

Title: *Mogao Caves Complex*

**Record Type:** built work  
**Catalog Level:** complex  
**Classification:** architecture  
**Work Type:** complexes (buildings)  
**Creator:** various artists  
**Date:** 4th to the 14th century  
**Location:** Mogao caves (ancient site) (Dunhuang, China)  
**Desc. Note:** 492 cells and cave sanctuaries in Mogao are famous for statues and wall paintings, spanning 1,000 years of Buddhist art.

Title: *Buddha from Cave 275*

**Relationship Type:** Whole/part

Title: *Mogao Cave 275 grouping*

**Broader Context:** Mogao Cave 275 [as an object grouping]  
**Relationship Type:** Whole/part
Exhaustivity

Associative relationship

- Movable works may be linked to built works

CONA ID 70000090 Work Type: house
Title: Case Study House No. 21
Creator: Pierre Koenig
Creation Date: 1956-1958; renovated 1998
Dimensions: 1 story, 1320 square feet, 4 rooms and 2 baths, on a 110 x 160 foot lot
Mat & Tech: and Techniques: steel frame and flat roof deck
Current Location: Los Angeles (California, USA)
Address: 1635 Woods Drive

CONA ID 70000090 Work Type: photograph
Title: Case Study House No. 21
Creator: Julius Shulman
Current Location: GRI Special Collections, Getty Center (Los Angeles, California); 2004.R.10-26622-32-LF

CONA ID 700000120 Work Type: architectural drawing
Title: Case Study House No. 21
Creator: Pierre Koenig
Current Location: GRI Special Collections, Getty Center (Los Angeles, California); 2006.M.30-
RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN WORKS may be rich and complex.

| CONA ID 700000435 | Class: prints and drawings | Work Type: design drawing | Title: Section and Elevation of the Dome and Half Model for St. Peter's, Rome | Subject/Title: Michelangelo | Date: mid 1550s | Medium: incised lines, charcoal with traces on paper | Dimensions: 270 x 267 cm | Type, Purpose, Method of Representation: Descriptive Note: This is the only known depiction of the dome and half model. Related Work: Dome of St. Peter's Basilica. Relationship type: design for. Current Location: Musée des Beaux-Arts (Lille, France). Collection Wicar, 93-94. |
| CONA ID 700000437 | Class: prints and drawings | Work Type: measured drawing | Title: External elevation of the model | Subject/Title: circle of Etienne Dupérac | Date: probably late 1560s | Medium: brown ink on paper | Dimensions: 5 x 4 x 2 m (4 sheets) | Scale: 1:15 | Descriptive Note: Probably done in preparation for the series of views. Current Location: Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, USA; 49.92.91. |

- St. Peter's in Rome and its dome
- predecessor of
- part of
- model for
- depiction of
- study for

Patricia Harpring © 2016 J. Paul Getty Trust. For educational purposes only. Do not distribute.
Exhaustivity

Titles or names

CONA ID 700000053  Class: architecture  Work Type: skyscraper
Title: Willis Tower
  Preference: preferred Date: renamed 16 July 2009
Title: Sears Tower  Preference: variant/alternate
Creator: Skidmore, Owings and Merrill (American, established 1939), for Sears Roebuck and
Company (American retail company, founded 1886); architect: Graham, Bruce
Creation Date: completed in 1973
Current Location: Chicago (Illinois, USA) Address: 233 South Wacker Drive Authority
Dimensions: height to the top of the roof: 442 m (1,450 feet); height to the highest occupied floor

Title: Willis Tower  Historical: Current
  Preference: preferred
  Date: renamed 16 July 2009
  Start: 2009  End: 9999
Title: Sears Tower  Historical: Historical
  Preference: variant/alternate Other [type]: former

- Include historical information when appropriate
- Include former names or titles
- Titles or names may have associated dates
- For rules for establishing Start and End dates, see CONA documentation
Exhaustivity

Roles of various creators

- Creator is required
- If there are multiple creators, list them all if known, along with roles
Exhaustivity

Creation and patronage

CONA ID 700000214
Classification architecture
Work Type mausoleum
Titles Taj Mahal

Creator Display:
architect: Ustad Ahmad Lahauri (Indian architect, ca.1580-1649);
patron: Shah Jahan (Mughal emperor, born ca. 1592)

Creation Date 1632-1653
General Subject architecture Type: isness
Specific burial Extent: purpose | Mumtaz Mahal Extent: dedication | Shah Jahan Extent: dedication
Current Location Agra, Uttar Pradesh, India ; 27°10’30”N 78°02’31”E
Dimensions height: 561 feet (171 m)
Mat & Tech: white marble

- Creator is required
- Patrons of architecture should be included
- In many cases, the patron is known but the architect is unknown

Images may be under additional copyright
Precoordination and Post-coordination
Pre-coordination or Post-coordination

**pre-coordination:** Combination of individual concepts into compound or complex terms at the point of data storage

**post-coordination:** Combination of individual concepts into compound or complex terms at the point of retrieval

- Which will your local system or authorities allow?
- What is your local methodology?
When you need compound terms that are not bound in the published authority, construct them locally.

- Compound terms are multiple-word terms.
- A published vocabulary typically limits inclusion of compound terms, only “unique concepts.”
- You may construct additional compound terms in the work record, “precoordination.”
- E.g., if you have a red silk and black wool vestment, indexing should bind “red” and “silk” together.

Material: red silk
precoordination

- Using separate fields that are bound, e.g., Material and Color
- Using subfields within a field
- **Indexing Using the Getty Vocabularies**

  **precoordination**

  - Using local compound terms that bind the two words together

  **Concept Authority**
  - Materials Facet (AAT)
  - Multiple subfields
  - Red silk (local)
  - Black silk (local)
  - Grey silk (local)
  - Pink silk (local)
  - Red silk (local)
  - White silk (local)
Uncertainty and Ambiguity

and Unknown and Undetermined
Uncertainty and Ambiguity

- Explain any controversies or ambiguous issues
- If an issue is in dispute, it is critical to the intellectual integrity of the record to not express it as a certain fact
- In order to correctly represent the information and allow scholarly research, indicate uncertainty and ambiguity as necessary
- The cataloger should never assume, never choose one choice over another, and never state as a fact something that is debated among experts
- Sources may reflect disputes about any number of characteristics of the work, including the attribution or dates for a particular work
- When multiple suggestions have been made, include the most important, in the method allowed by individual elements
Uncertainty and Ambiguity

- Where a choice must be made for preferred information, prefer the information as accepted by the repository of the work.
- Other information, including conflicting opinions, should also be included provided the source is expert and authoritative.
- Always cite the source of the information.
Issues for Indexing

- **When fields do not display to end-users,** estimating indexing values is flexible
- Some fields do not display to end-users; for example, the Start Date and End Date do not display to end-users
- For these fields, estimate broadly the span of time that is applicable
- Estimating too narrowly will result in failed retrieval
- However, estimating overly broadly will result in false hits in retrieval
- Rules for estimating in various situations are in CWDA and CONA guidelines
  See CONA guidelines
  “3.6.1.18.5.1 Minimum requirements for Start Date and End Date”
**Example: When a particular year is unknown**

### Start and End Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONA ID</th>
<th>700008595</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>costume</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Work Type</td>
<td>mask</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titles</td>
<td>Face Mask</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creator</td>
<td>unknown Igbo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation Date</td>
<td>early to mid-20th century</td>
<td>1900-1960</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start:</td>
<td>1900</td>
<td>End: 1960</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation Place</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Subject</td>
<td>apparel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific</td>
<td>face</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dimensions</td>
<td>unavailable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mat &amp; Tech</td>
<td>wood, cloth, glass beads, metal, buttons, kaolin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Exact year of creation is often unknown
- Express ambiguity and nuance in display date
Example: When a particular year is unknown

Start and End Dates

CONA ID 700008596 Catalog Level: item
Class: prints and drawings  Work Type: drawing
Title: Pennsylvania German Dish
Creator: rendered by Albert Levone
Creation Date: ca. 1935
Current Location: National Gallery of Art (Washington, DC)
Mat & Tech: watercolor, graphite, and gouache on paperboard
Dimensions: overall: 34 x 28 cm (13 3/8 x 11 in.)

Creation Date: ca. 1935
Start: 1930  End: 1940

CONA guidelines:
“ca.: For circa (ca.), for works produced within the last several centuries, use a 10-year span for start date and end date (e.g., subtract five years from start date and add five years to end date to create a 10-year span (e.g., creation display date = ca. 1860 could be indexed start date = 1855, end date = 1865).”

Index of American Design; 1943.8.8102
Description: Pennsylvania German Folk Art from the Index of American Design. Dishes made by Pennsylvania German potters came in a variety of sizes and shapes. This oval one with scalloped edges was elaborately decorated by the sgraffito technique. Notice the bold floral design that contrasts with the light strokes of lettering that form a delicate border. Splashes of green worked into the glaze heighten the color of the red clay that is exposed. The dish was made by Samuel Troxel. The inscription reads: "From clay and many skills, the potter fashions what he will, July the 19th 1823."
Related Work: Pennsylvania German Dish
Example: When a particular year is unknown

Start and End Dates

- When date or range is uncertain, express what is known, e.g., “completed by”

**CONA ID** 70000162  **Catalog Level:** item  **Class:** sculpture

**Work Type:** model

**Title:** Wooden model for the façade of San Lorenzo, Florence

**Creator:** Michelangelo

**Creation Date:** completed by 1555

**Current Location:** Casa Buonarroti (Florence, Italy)

**Start:** 1550  **End:** 1555

**Creation Date:** completed by 1555

**Start:** 1550  **End:** 1555

**General Subject:** architecture  **Type:** description

**Specific:** façade

**Descriptive Note:** This is probably one of the two models described by Michelangelo in a letter to his brother, Lionardo, in September 1555. It was ...
Possible resolutions if data is unknown or ambiguous: index using broader term or index both

Other Issues for Indexing

- **When fields display to end users:** Most fields in a work record are displayed to end-users, both the display fields and often also the indexing fields.
- If a field is visible to the end user (even though also used in retrieval), do not make wild estimations or guess.
- However, if a specific value is in question, use a broader value or use both of two possible values, depending upon the circumstances.
When to use a broader value

Other Issues for Indexing

- **Work Types, materials, culture:** Using the AAT, choose the most specific term appropriate; however, do not guess
- For example, if you are not sure if the process by which the work was made is *steel engraving*, use the broader term *engraving*
- For any uncertain or ambiguous situations, explain in a display field or the descriptive note
- For further guidance, see CONA Guidelines:
  “3.6.1.2 Work Type,” “3.6.2.2 Material Term,” “3.6.2.15 Culture Term”
Example: Index to specificity known
(“Specificity and Exhaustivity” are discussed in more detail above)

Materials Indexing Terms

[CONA ID: 700001088]
Title: A mandarin paying a visit of ceremony
Title: Mandarin rendant une visite de cérémonie
Date: published: ca. 1845
Creator Display: Fox, Angus, after drawing by Thomas Allom; published by Fisher, Son and Company
Related Person: Fox, Angus (British printmaker, 19th century) role: engraver
Related Person: Allom, Thomas (British architect, 1804-1872) role: draftsman
Related Corporate Body: Fisher, Son and Company (British publisher and printer, active 1821-1845) role: publisher

Materials Display: steel engraving, hand colored
Materials Index:
steel engraving (printing process) [AAT]
hand coloring [AAT]

- If it were not known that this technique is steel engraving, cataloger should use the broader AAT term engraving
When to index both possible values

Issues for Indexing

• **Locations:** For example, if sources disagree about whether a work was created in 15th-century Bruges or Brussels, you could
  1) index the culture as *Flemish* (encompassing both Bruges and Brussels during this period), and/or
  2) index both cities using TGN; links to TGN should be repeatable

• Explain in the Descriptive Note that scholars disagree regarding if the work was created in Bruges or Brussels

• For further guidance, see CONA Guidelines:
  3.6.1.19.5.2 How to record the Location

• Flags: For flags and other fields that are not repeatable, where you must choose one value only, make the best choice possible based on the information at hand

Indexed place names display to the end user
Various issues regarding location are covered in CONA documentation
Example: When the location could be either of two places

Location

CONA ID: 700002654
Title: Bishop Theophilus Finding the Grave of Saint Anthony
Creator: Master of the Brussels Romuléon or workshop (Flemish, active about 1465)
Classification: manuscripts  Work Type: folio  Culture: Flemish
Locations: Current: J. Paul Getty Museum at the Getty Center (Los Angeles, Los Angeles County, California, United States) [ULAN 500329598]  Repository Numbers: 83.MN.127.29; Ms. Ludwig XI 8, fol. 29

- Creation location for this work may be either of two places
- Explain in the Descriptive Note, but index both places to allow retrieval by either

Culture: Flemish

Locations:

Current: J. Paul Getty Museum at the Getty Center (Los Angeles, California, United States) [ULAN 500329598]  Repository Numbers: 83.MN.127.29; Ms. Ludwig XI 8, fol. 29

Other: Bruxelles [TGN 7007868]  Type: creation
Other: Brugge [TGN 7007867]  Type: creation

Hierarchy: part of    Invention et translation du corps de Saint Antoine
Example: When creator is a known individual

Creator and other people

- CONA ID 700008851
- Classification paintings  Work Type painting | leaf
- Title Sitting on Rocks Gazing at Clouds
- Title 宋 李唐 坐石看雲
- Title Assis sur des rochers en regardant les nuages

**Creator Display:**
Li Tang (Chinese painter, 1050s-after 1130)
Person: [ULAN 500321561]

- Creation Date 12th century
- Culture: Song dynasty
- General Subject landscapes
- Specific rocks | clouds
- Current Location National Palace Museum (Taipei, Taiwan)
- Dimensions 27.7 x 30 cm
- Mat & Tech: album leaf, ink and colors on silk
Example: When creator is a corporate body

Creator and other people

CONA ID 700008565 Classification sculpture
Work Type figurine
Title Beltrame di Milano

Creator Display: Meissen Porcelain Manufactory
(German porcelain factory, 1710 to the present)
    Corp. Body: [ULAN 500054662]

Creation Date ca. 1720
General Subject literature
Specific Beltrame di Milano | Commedia dell’Arte
Current Location J. Paul Getty Museum (Los Angeles, California); 86.DE.542
Creation Place: Meissen (Germany)
Dimensions 6 1/2 x 2 11/16 x 2 5/8 inches
Mat & Tech: hard-paste porcelain
Example: When creator is anonymous

Anonymous creators

CONA ID 700008566  
Classification enamels  
Work Type triptych  
Titles The Last Judgment

Creator Display: Master of the Orléans Triptych  
(French, active late 15th–early 16th century)  
Person: [ULAN 500005454]

Creation Date ca. 1500  
General Subject religion and mythology  
Specific Last Judgement  
Dimensions center plaque 25 x 22 cm; left plaque 25 x 10 cm; right plaque 25 x 10 cm  
Mat & Tech: painted enamels on copper, partly gilded

- Hand is identified  
- Known by appellation devised by scholars or repositories  
- Nationality and dates surmised from loci and dates of activity
Example: When creator is unknown

Unknown creators

CONA ID 700008567 Classification ceramics
Work Type vessel
Titles Vulture Vessel

**Creator Display:** unknown Aztec
Cultural Group: [ULAN 500202913]

Creation Date 1200/1521
General Subject
  utilitarian objects Indexing Type: isness
  religion and mythology
Specific Subject
  New World vulture (Cathartidae (family))

Creation Place: Mexico
Dimensions height: 8 3/4 inches
Mat & Tech: ceramic
Culture: Aztec

- Identity of hand is unknown
- Creator field refers to culture of creation, not an individual
- If creator is missing in contributed data, map from Culture
Example: When creator is qualified

Attribution qualifiers

- Use an attribution qualifier if the attribution to a given named artist is not certain
- Link to the named artist

**Creator Display:**
attributed to Samuel McIntire (American, 1757-1811)

**Role:** designer

**Person:** McIntire, Samuel

**Qualifier:** attributed to
Example: When to include style and culture

Style and culture

- May record Style and also Culture
- May specify “Type” if desired
Unknown and Undetermined

- What should the cataloger do if core information is limited or not available?
- When an element is indicated as required, this means that the element must be included
- However, it is recognized that occasionally data for any element may be missing during the cataloging process
Unknown and Undetermined

- Knowing that information is unknown or undetermined is important to users, particularly for the required core fields
- Values for required fields must be supplied, even when the information is unknown or uncertain
- When the information is unknown at the time of cataloging, include an appropriate designation indicating the state of knowledge or availability of information
- For fields that are not core, the cataloger may leave the field blank or null, or include *unknown* etc. if so desired by the cataloging institution
- Note that null values will not be displayed to end-users and will likely be omitted in transfer of data; values such as *unknown* should be included in data exchanges and publications of the data
Knowable vs. Unknowable
Knowable vs. Unknowable

- When information is unavailable at the time of cataloging, the cataloger may use values such as unknown, unavailable, undetermined, or not applicable, provided documentation or context explains to the user the meaning of these words for the given field.
- For required fields and in other contexts, including such values is better than omitting the information entirely, particularly when the possibility exists for the record to be enhanced in later passes at cataloging, or to provide clarity in retrieval and research.
- Has the cataloging institution simply forgotten to include the information?
- Or has the field been considered, but at this time the information is not available?
- Including such values for unavailable information clarifies the situation for users, while a blank field does not.
Knowable vs. Unknowable

- **Knowable information**
  - For information that is knowable but simply unknown by you, always use a more general term or omit the information.
  - When the lack of knowledge is due to your ignorance regarding the issue, do not use terms such as "probably" or "perhaps" because this implies that scholars are uncertain of this information.

- **Debated information**
  - For information that is unknowable because scholars disagree because the historical or archaeological information is incomplete or interpretation of the information is debated, you may use terms such as "probably" or "perhaps" to explain the ambiguity or uncertainty in a Display Date or Scope (Descriptive) Note.
Knowable vs. Unknowable

- In various fields, rules regarding how to deal with unknown information, uncertainty, and ambiguity may differ.
- One of the most common ways of dealing with such information is to state the vagary in a display field, and then to index with all authoritative, probable terms for that display.
- Another common method, for fields without accompanying display fields, is to index using a broader term that is known to be correct, rather than a narrow term that could be incorrect.
Using the hierarchy for indexing

- Index with a specific narrower term only if information is supplied by sources
- If unknown, use a broader term, even "vessel"
Using the hierarchy for indexing

- Index with a specific narrower corporate body only if information is supplied by sources
- If unknown, use a broader entity “Gobelins”

**Creator Display:**

Woven at Gobelins Tapestry Manufactory; after cartoon by Albert Eckhout and Frans Post, painters

**ULAN**

- Gobelins Furniture Manufactory
- Gobelins Marquetry Studio
- Gobelins Pietra Dura Studio
- Gobelins Metalwork Studio
- Gobelins Engraving Studio
- Gobelins Silversmiths' Studio
- Gobelins Painting Studio
- Gobelins Sculpture Studio
- Gobelins Tapestry Manufactory
- Gobelins Dye Works
Using associative relationships for indexing

- Index with a specific member of the firm only if you know who made the drawing
- If unknown, use a broader reference to the firm

Names:
- Richard Meier & Partners (preferred, display, V)
- Richard Meier and Partners (V)

Associative Relationships: members are
- Richard Meier
- Michael Palladino
- James R. Crawford
- Bernhard Karpf
- Reynolds Logan

3-D model of Douglas House from Great Buildings online; photo of Atheneum, New Harmony, IN, Avery Fischer Hall, New York, from http://www.richardmeier.com/
Disagreement among Sources

- Know your sources
- When two sources disagree, prefer the information obtained from the most scholarly, authoritative, recent source
Sample Scenarios
Sample Scenario 1

- If two authoritative sources disagree on the date of creation of a work (one prefers ca. 1510, but another of equal authority prefers ca. 1525), this dispute may be referenced in a display date: created ca. 1510 or ca. 1525, and explained more fully in the Descriptive Note.

- Then the dates for retrieval on creation date should encompass the full range of possible dates, also estimating a range of a few extra years to include the uncertainty of ca.: Earliest: 1505; Latest: 1530.

- NB: If the work is in the possession of a repository, the opinion of the repository should take precedence over varying opinions by outside scholars; however, the full scholarly debate should be represented as possible, with methods of doing so varying dependent upon the field.
Sample Scenario 2

- If the available authoritative information indicates a work is made of metal, but the cataloger consulting an illustration feels it looks like silver, the cataloger should never rely upon their own judgment with such lack of substantiating evidence.
- The cataloger should index the material as the general metal rather than risking the introduction of erroneous more specific information.
Sample Scenario 3

- If one source calls the work by an anonymous artist French and a second source calls it Flemish, for display, the cataloger should not necessarily state that the work is French or Flemish in a note field, because this implies that scholarship agrees it could be either.

- Instead, the cataloger should state the cultural origin of the work based on the most reliable, recent sources.

- Perhaps with further investigation, the cataloger will discover that although it was in the 19th century considered French, modern scholars agree it is Flemish.

- If indeed modern scholars differ on their opinions and are equally divided, then the cataloger may indeed state French or Flemish.

- If the work was formerly known as French, the cataloger should index both French and Flemish for retrieval.