Table of Contents

• Current Status and Context

• Overview of Selected Issues

• Getty Vocabularies: the Future

* This document is a more comprehensive version of the material presented at Unbiased Terminology workshop

3 May 2022

University of Antwerp; Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage; Faro (Flemish Institution for Cultural Heritage); AAT Flemish-Dutch Working Group

YouTube: https://youtu.be/AlznfxKwl6Y
Getty Vocabularies: Current Status and Context
In a global environment where we strive to be more open and equitable, while maintaining high standards for scholarship and research, Getty Vocabularies can be tools to facilitate such goals for art history and related disciplines.

- Longstanding goals of the Getty Vocabulary Program are to make AAT, TGN, ULAN, CONA, and IA ever more multilingual, multicultural, and inclusive, focusing also on diversity, equity, unbiased and antiracist terminology, and accessibility.

- This presentation lays out a selection of the issues surrounding the accomplishment of these goals.

- We do not yet have all the answers – successful resolutions in a rapidly changing world will be ongoing, occurring over months and years and in concert with the expert contributor and user communities of the Getty Vocabularies.

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/
What Are the Getty Vocabularies

- **Structured, linked vocabularies**: AAT, TGN, ULAN, CONA, IA
- **Relationships**: Thesauri, 3 relationships: equivalence (synonyms), hierarchical (broader-narrower), associative (btwn records, not hierarchical)
- **Standards-compliant**: Comply with standards for controlled vocabularies (ISO, NISO)
- **Authoritative**: Vocabularies cite authoritative sources and contributors; but not authoritarian (may use variant terms)
- **Scope**: Getty Vocabularies strive to be ever more multilingual, multicultural, and inclusive, within scope of visual arts
- **Target Domain**: Traditional audience (art and architecture domains: visual resources, catalogers, museums), plus scholars, and related disciplines (archaeology, conservation)
- **Collaborative**: Grow through contributions from expert user community: institutions, consortia, and projects
What Are the Getty Vocabularies

- **Coreferences**: They contain coreferences to other resources where topics overlap (e.g., ULAN http://vocab.getty.edu/page/ulan/500337743 = LOC https://lccn.loc.gov/nr2002038798)

- **How unique**: Getty Vocabularies are unique in their global coverage of the defined domain of visual arts, in citing published sources and contributors, in allowing interconnections among historical and current information, in accommodating the sometimes debated and ambiguous nature of art historical information, and in allowing complex relationships within and between Vocabularies.

- **Rich knowledge bases**: They are not simple 'value vocabularies' or authorities; they are rich 'knowledge bases' in themselves, intended for research and discovery.

- **Minimum vs rich**: Although each Vocabulary requires a small set of minimum data, the data model allows for rich data that may be exploited for research and discovery.

- **Multicultural**: Getty Vocabularies strive to be ever more multilingual, multicultural, and inclusive.

---

Goals and Mission

- Multilingual
- Multicultural
- Diversity
- Inclusive
- Equity
- Unbiased
- Antiracist
- Accessible

---

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/
What Are the Getty Vocabularies

• **AAT**, *Art & Architecture Thesaurus®* includes generic terms in several languages, relationships, sources, and scope notes for agents, work types, roles, materials, styles, cultures, and techniques (e.g., *amphora, oil paint, olieverf, peintures à l’huile, acetylolysis, 玉器, Jadekünste, sintering, orthographic drawings, Olmeca, Rinascimento, Buddhism, watercolors, asa-no-ha-toji*)

• **TGN**, *Getty Thesaurus of Geographic Names®* includes names, relationships, and coordinates, with special focus on historical information for current cities, historical nations, empires, archaeological sites, lost settlements, and physical features as necessary for cataloging art; not GIS but may include coreferences to GIS and maps (e.g., *Diospolis, Acalán, Ottoman Empire, Mogao, Ch’ien-fu-tung, Ganges River, गंगा नदी*)

• **ULAN**, *Union List of Artist Names®* includes names, relationships, notes, sources, and biographical information for artists, architects, firms, studios, repositories, patrons, and other individuals and corporate bodies, both named and anonymous; may include coreferences to other resources for same entity (e.g., *Mark Rothko, Cai Xiang, 葵襄, Crevelle Master, Riza Abbasi, Altobelli & Molins, Rajaraja Museum*)

• **IA**, *Getty Iconography Authority™* includes proper names, relationships, and dates for iconographical narratives, religious or fictional characters, historical events, names of literary works and performing art; special focus on non-Western with coreferences to other resources including Iconclass for Western (e.g., *Viaggio dei Re Magi, Flood of Deucalion, French Revolution, Olouaipipilele, Xibalba, Niflheim, जिवान, Shiva, Bouddha couche*)

• **CONA**, *Cultural Objects Name Authority®* focuses on architecture, multiples, and works depicted in other works; includes titles, artist attribution, creation dates, relationships, and location for works whether extant or destroyed (new contribution: 70,000 works from BWR) (e.g., *Chayasomesvara Temple, Hagia Sofia, Αγία Σοφία, The Lacemaker, La Dentellière, Merlettaia, Lion Throne Room, 神奈川沖浪, Great Wave, Die große Welle*)
Goals and Mission

• How to make the Vocabularies more

Multilingual
Multicultural
Diversity
Inclusive
Equity
Unbiased
Antiracist
Accessible

Where We Are Now, Where We Are Going

• How to measure multiculturality?
• Historical content of Vocabularies was often Western-centric
How Do We Get There?

- How do we accomplish more multilingual, multicultural, and inclusive terminology combined with rich, linked content?
- How do we facilitate the use of unbiased terminology?
- How do we facilitate antiracist and correct postcolonization content?
- How do we facilitate content for diverse audiences?
- How do we facilitate inclusive and neutral content?
- Do we play it safe and avoid controversial topics, or are we leaders?
- How do we avoid conflict between personal privacy & scholarly info?
- How do we provide accessible content for inclusive audiences in all realms: scholarly, technical, and the generally interested?
- How do we balance responsibility to current users while still remaining relevant re. technical advancement?
- Many more questions …

First let’s start with an overview of the context in which the Getty Vocabularies exist →
Institutional Plans and Policies

[https://www.getty.edu/about/governance/pdfs/deai_plan.pdf](https://www.getty.edu/about/governance/pdfs/deai_plan.pdf)

* Getty Diversity, Equity, Accessibility, and Inclusion Plan

*January 2021*

Comprehensive and meaningful change does not happen immediately. We will build on this foundation to implement systems with lasting impact. We commit to the following five goals:

1. Develop Getty’s workforce to reflect the diversity of Southern California and the nation
2. Confront and eliminate racism and discrimination in the workplace
3. Improve communication within Getty community to help contribute to a culture of trust
4. Enhance diversity and accessibility of collections, interpretations, exhibitions, digital content, education, and public programs
5. Deepen engagement between all areas of Getty and BIPOC and other diverse communities, locally and nationally

---

Working groups and policies are active

Striving over time to meet goals

Not all are directly related to publication of Getty Vocabularies
Institutional Plans and Policies

https://www.getty.edu/research/institute/antiracist_statement.html

**Getty Research Institute: Anti-Racist Statement**

The Getty Research Institute is committed to addressing biased language, distortion, and the erasure of marginalized individuals and communities in the descriptions of our collections.

Archival and bibliographic description is not neutral, and neither are librarians and archivists. While we strive to describe collection materials and their creators respectfully, accurately, and with care for the communities who use and are represented in them, we recognize that we may not always initially succeed in this endeavor. The library and archives staff of the Getty Research Institute is dedicated to critically examining descriptive practices and to using appropriate, inclusive, and respectful language. As remediation, we have initiated a collaborative, iterative project to identify areas for improvement in our descriptive practices. Our primary goals in undertaking this project are to disrupt, discontinue, and atone for the histories of oppression present within the art historical and American library and archival traditions.
African American Art History Initiative

This transformational research initiative focuses on the postwar art and cultural legacy of artists of African American and African diasporic heritage. The Getty Research Institute's objective is to provide a more robust and accurate history of American art, one that will have a decisive impact on the narrative of global culture.

Recognizing the extraordinary contributions that have already been made to the field, the Research Institute will partner with institutions and individuals locally and nationally on projects that support their work. These collaborations will make the archival and published record of African American art history freely accessible, both nationally and internationally, in physical and digital form.

Florentine Codex Initiative

Since 2016, the Florentine Codex, an encyclopedia of Nahua knowledge and history of early modern Mexico, has been the focus of a collaborative research and publication initiative of the Getty Research Institute, the Seaver Institute, and the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana. The initiative's goal is to give global access to the manuscript and disseminate knowledge about its cultural significance. The research focuses on Book 12 of the codex, the most extensive historical account of the conquest of Mexico (1519–1521), written in Nahuatl and documenting the Mexica perspective.
The archive includes 3.35 million negatives and slides, 983,000 photographs, 166,000 contact sheets, and 9,000 audio and visual recordings, comprising the most significant collection illustrating African American life in the 20th century. The archive was acquired last year for $30 million by the Ford Foundation, the J. Paul Getty Trust, the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation, The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation and the Smithsonian Institution in an effort to safeguard the unparalleled treasure of African American history and culture for the public benefit.
Remedial Efforts re Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>folle</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>fou</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>primitif</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>arriéré</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>barbare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>bizarre</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>dément</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>dingue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>éminent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>indigène</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>infirme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>invalide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>petit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>sauvage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Amérindien</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>attardé</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>boiteux</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>bonhomme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example: Getty Provenance Index search for potentially problematic words online
2022, Webinar dealing with the following:

• Recognize ways in which systemic racism and bias are hidden within library catalog records and metadata;
• Understand the opportunities and limitations in addressing problematic language in the catalog;
• Leverage procedures, processes, and other resources appropriate for all libraries; and
• Design community engagement and public programming around the use of catalog language.
Library community

Efforts of Related Disciplines

https://www.ala.org/

ALA Chapters Condemn Systemic Racism

In addition to the American Library Association’s Executive Board’s statement on racism, several ALA chapters have stated their statements below.

Anti-Racist resources for the library profession, including plan for action and staff development resources, can be found on the Libraries Respond - Black Lives Matter webpage.

Contact CRO Program Officer, Mariel Colbert to add a statement to this list.
Greetings from the Equitable Action Committee!

We would like to highlight the numerous Pre-Conference and Conference events that relate to the VRA’s equity, diversity, inclusion, and accessibility efforts. We hope you are able to join us virtually and/or in person.
Efforts of Related Disciplines

https://www2.archivists.org/

"Protocols for Native American Archival Materials": Information and Resources Page

Steering Committee Roster

Overview, History, and Guidelines

This page provides an overview of where to find information about the Protocols for Native American Archival Materials (PNAAM) publication, as well as reports about what
Museum community

Efforts re content, visitors, hiring

Efforts of Related Disciplines

https://www.aam-us.org/

Diversity, Equity, Accessibility, and Inclusion

Anti-Racist by Design: How the Oakland Museum of California Is Building Equity into Its Practices

At the Oakland Museum of California (OMCA), diversity, equity, inclusion, access, and anti-racism are commitments that have long been a part of our DNA, both internally and in our work with...
“More than 600 geographic sites across the US will be renamed, replacing a derogatory term for Indigenous women used for decades

The Department of the Interior is moving forward with removing and replacing a derogatory term for Indigenous women used for decades across the US, the department said Tuesday.
University community

Defining practice and terminology

* Intended as examples. Not a comprehensive nor necessarily representative list

Efforts of Related Disciplines

Be aware of ongoing discussions and trends

- Terminology - Diversity & Inclusion
- Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Glossary of Terms | Pacific University
- Being Antiracist | National Museum of African American History and Culture

Antiracist Glossary and Terms | Diversity, Inclusion, and Equity
A dialect of English that is stigmatized due to the history of racism in America. Ableism. Ableism is prejudice and discrimination against people with...

Glossary - Anti-Racism Toolkit - Guides at Georgetown University
Mar 22, 2022 — Glossary of Terms. Ally: Someone who makes the commitment and effort to recognize their privilege (based on gender, class, race,...

Glossary - Anti-Racism Digital Library
Efforts of Related Disciplines

Be aware of ongoing discussions and trends

* Intended as examples. Not a comprehensive nor necessarily representative list
Published scholarship

Common usage of terminology in authoritative sources has a direct effect on content of Getty Vocabularies

* Intended as examples. Not a comprehensive nor necessarily representative list

---

**Efforts of Related Disciplines**

Update Vocabularies preferred terms to reflect usage in scholarship

---

Raising the dead: walls of names as mnemonic devices to commemorate enslaved people

Al Araujo - Current Anthropology, 2020 - journals.uchicago.edu

… Identified through physical characteristics, enslaved people were listed in ship manifests and farm books as ordinary commodities. Yet lists of names of enslaved men, women, and …

☆ Save  Cite  Cited by 5  Related articles  All 5 versions

A “tone of voice peculiar to New-England” Fugitive Slave Advertisements and the Heterogeneity of Enslaved People of African Descent in Eighteenth-Century Quebec

CA Nelson - Current Anthropology, 2020 - journals.uchicago.edu

… active and ongoing negation of their colonial and slaving histories—I have consciously chosen to use the terms “runaway” and “fugitive,” not because that is what the enslaved people …

☆ Save  Cite  Cited by 3  Related articles  All 2 versions

The Jamaican airs: An introduction to unpublished pieces of musical notation from enslaved people in the eighteenth-century Caribbean

D Leigh - Atlantic Studies, 2020 - Taylor & Francis

… This half features the most extensive pieces of musical notation from the early-modern era of songs that were composed and performed by enslaved people. The present article is an …

☆ Save  Cite  Cited by 5  Related articles  All 2 versions

Reorienting the “origins debate”: Anglo-American trafficking in enslaved people, c. 1615–1660

LH Roper - Atlantic Studies, 2022 - Taylor & Francis

This article argues that trafficking in enslaved Africans and Natives constituted a chief element in English overseas colonization and was a primary component of English overseas trade …

☆ Save  Cite

Example where preponderance of use in scholarly publications informs change in preferred term (history, anthropology = “enslaved people” vs “slaves”)

---

* Getty Vocabularies: Diversity and Inclusion, May 2022*
 Getty Vocabularies: Overview of Selected Issues
Defining the Issues

Selected issues that are illustrated in this presentation

• To provide structure and practice to facilitate diverse points of view
• To facilitate use of unbiased terminology
• To facilitate terms to express ambiguity or uncertainty
• To facilitate terms and structure to express various cultural points of view
• To acknowledge various cultural traditions
• To be sensitive to preferred terms: Ethnicity
• To be sensitive to preferred terms: Gender identity, preferences
• To be sensitive to biased historical points of view
• To respect personal privacy balanced with critical ability to research
• To ensure accessibility and inclusivity for user community
Defining the Issues

Basic considerations when you resolve the selected issues

• Getty Vocabularies provide terminology in use by the community, they do not prescribe *how to use terms* beyond Scope Note suggestions

• Getty Vocabularies do not prescribe, but instead assist in decision-making by providing contextual information
  • Rich ‘preferences’ inform users: a) for record = most commonly used in authoritative scholarly publications; b) for each language; b) for each contributor; b) for each source
  • Additional flags further classify terms; e.g., those deemed pejorative or objectionable are labeled “avoid use” for new indexing; those particular to a given culture are noted
  • Historical, obsolete, and even objectionable terms are not deleted (since they provide access) for research and discovery
We in the Getty Vocabulary Program (GVP) are not numerous enough, representative enough, or expert enough to ourselves make such weighty decisions regarding which terms are best for each of the millions of Vocabulary records.

Getty Vocabularies’ users may look to professional organizations for guidelines for usage on unbiased, antiracist, correct postcolonial terminology, etc.

Through contributions to the Vocabularies, the expert contributor community may actuate change:

- Could form consortia to reach consensus and contribute to GVP
- Could survey professional organizations already making these decisions, and then you contribute to GVP with sources noted
Languages and Linking = Multiple Views

• Multilingual context & relationships between records

Vocabularies' structure and practice can facilitate diverse points of view

Multilingual terminology and interconnectedness allows for multiple points of views
Flexibility Is a Feature of Getty Vocabs

• Rich contextual information
  Data model allows for rich context, not simple ‘value vocabularies’

• Core fields
  Always include Core fields. Do not leave important fields blank, e.g., knowing the dimensions are “unavailable” is useful information to the researcher, while an empty field is useless

• “Display” format information is separate from indexing
  
  Display date: finished ca. 1810  Start: 1805  End: 1815
  Materials: gouache and gold leaf on parchment  AAT: gouache_300070114

• Scope the usage broadly enough, but not too broad
  If not exact synonym, make a new record, e.g., using indigenous language, “kākaku” as separate record, not a Maori-translated term for “cloak”

• Unknown vs. unknowable
  Distinguish when data is unknowable by scholarly community, or simply unknown due to cataloger lack of knowledge

• Broad and correct vs specific and wrong
  Do not guess; e.g., index material as broad “metal,” do not guess “cast iron”

• Specificity and Exhaustivity
  Be consistent re how specific and also how exhaustive (no. of terms) indexing will be; indexing minute details may not be useful, judge based on audience and your cataloging resources

Examples of established rules and best practice critical to allow indexing and then meaningful research in many contexts, including topics re diversity and inclusiveness
**Getty Vocabularies: Diversity and Inclusion, May 2022**

**Note:** Refers to ancient Greek small, deep bowls that curve in sharply at the shoulder and have a distinct neck with overhanging lip and round bottom designed so the bowl could sit on a stand; they may have feet. A lebes is equipped with a pair of upright handles at the shoulder and often with a domed cover topped by a tall, stemmed handle. Bronze lebetes were used for cooking and those made of terracotta were used for mixing wine. They are distinguished from "dinoi" by their smaller size. Many scholars in the past have used the term to refer to both the dinos and lebes, because they thought that the term dinos referred to a cup.

**术语:**

- **lebetes** (vessels (containers), <containers by form>, ... Furnishings and E)
  - **Note:** Refers to ancient Greek small, deep bowls that curve in sharply at the shoulder and have a distinct neck with overhanging lip and round bottom designed so the bowl could sit on a stand; they may have feet. A lebes is equipped with a pair of upright handles at the shoulder and often with a domed cover topped by a tall, stemmed handle. Bronze lebetes were used for cooking and those made of terracotta were used for mixing wine. They are distinguished from "dinoi" by their smaller size. Many scholars in the past have used the term to refer to both the dinos and lebes, because they thought that the term dinos referred to a cup.

**Terms:**

- **lebetes**
  - (preferred) C, U, English-P, D, U, PN
  - (Dutch-P, D, U, U)

- **lebes**
  - C, U, English, AD, U, SN
  - (Dutch, AD, U, U)
  - (Spanish-P, D, U, PN)

- **λέβης**
  - (C, U, Greek-P, AD, U, U)

- **碗形金属器** (C, U, Chinese (traditional)-)

**dinoi (lebetes)**
- J, English, UF, U, U

**Note:** incorrect usage

**“Other” Flag**

- Formula
- Symbol
- Official term
- Provisional term
- Avoid Use
- Deprecated
- Pejorative

Flag to indicate “Avoid Use”
Defining the Issues

Inform users by flagging terms
Example: ‘illegal aliens’ has pejorative connotations. Deprecated to UF, cautionary flag attached. May be used for retrieval, but should be avoided in new indexing. ‘undocumented immigrants’ is new record-preferred term
Defining the Issues

Facilitate use of unbiased terminology

Authoritative source made change to deprecate ‘illegal aliens,’ thus provides warrant for change in AAT

Note: In LOC, not all 450-fields are true synonyms; but in AAT all UFs must be true synonyms.

Purposes differ: LOC is grouping headings that may be used to index similar topics in books, but AAT is grouping synonyms for disambiguation and precision in indexing and research

Thus AAT may not exactly reflect the LOC terminology

AAT pref = ‘undocumented immigrant’
Facilitate use of unbiased terminology

AAT includes non-synonymous terms in separate concept records.

Defining the Issues

**noncitizens** (<people by state or condition>, people (agents), People (hierarchy name))

*Note:* Unnaturalized foreign residents of a country, nation, or state who do not hold official citizenship status within that place. Noncitizens may or may not possess residence documentation.

**expatriates** (<people by state or condition>, people (agents), People (hierarchy name))

*Note:* Refers to persons who have withdrawn voluntarily from their native country, especially those who have renounced allegiance to it. For persons who have fled their native country or country of residence to escape danger or persecution, use "refugees."
Defining the Issues

Example: Most authoritative sources speak of “enslaved people” instead of “slaves.” Reason: Formulated in this way, the term separates a person's identity from their circumstance.

Be aware of and be willing to make changes re the term marked “preferred” based on authoritative sources.

Facilitate use of unbiased terminology.

AAT

"Other" Flag

Flag to indicate “Avoid Use”
Facilitate use of unbiased terminology

Authoritative sources may be perceived as somewhat slow (e.g., proposed in 2021, adopted in 2022)

However, on the other hand, making precipitous changes in an evolving environment disrupts consistency and reliability for users

Defining the Issues

In September 2021, a proposal was submitted to change Slaves to Enslaved persons. The Library of Congress took the proposal under advisement for more research and evaluation, and determined that the proposal would be re-considered and a decision would be made in March 2022.

Online as of 22 May 2022

LC control no.: sj2021051779
LCCN Permalink: https://lccn.loc.gov/sj2021051779

HEADING: Slaves
150  a Slaves
450  a Enslaved persons
550  w g a Persons
Defining the Issues

A coarse-grained igneous rock that has been subjected to metamorphic processes, formed by cooling of silica-rich magma below the surface of the earth at great depths and pressures. It is the most common intrusive acid igneous rock of the Earth's crust. Granite is commonly found on continents, but is virtually absent from the ocean basins...Granite is primarily composed of feldspar, quartz, and mica along with various other minerals in varying percentages. Granite is frequently used for buildings and monuments.

Note: A coarse-grained igneous rock that has been subjected to metamorphic processes, formed by cooling of silica-rich magma below the surface of the earth at great depths and pressures. It is the most common intrusive acid igneous rock of the Earth's crust. Granite is commonly found on continents, but is virtually absent from the ocean basins...Granite is primarily composed of feldspar, quartz, and mica along with various other minerals in varying percentages. Granite is frequently used for buildings and monuments.
Defining the Issues

Example of terms for rocks that are classified differently by Maori culture

**pounamu** (rock (inorganic material)

*Note:* General term for greenstone found on South Island, New Zealand. The term refers to any of three different types of stone: nephrite, bowenite, and serpentinite. Maori do not classify pounamu by geological origin, but by appearance according to color, markings, and translucency. There are many local names for different pounamu, but four main varieties are widely recognized: inanga, kahurangi, kawakawa and tangiwai.

**Terms:**

- **pounamu** *(preferred C,U,English-P,D,L,N, Dutch-P,D,U,U, Maori,UF,U,U)*
- **poenamu** *(C,U,English,UF,U,N)*
'Anasazi' is avoided in modern usage, contemporary Pueblo peoples do not prefer it.

Coincides with preponderance of modern scholarly usage.

Defining the Issues

Anasazi (Pre-Columbian Pueblo styles, Pre-Columbian Southwestern North American styles, ... Styles and Periods (hierarchy name))

Note: Refers to the style and culture of a North American civilization that existed in the "Four Corners" area, where the boundaries of the states of Arizona, New Mexico, Colorado, and Utah intersect. The culture flourished from the first century CE to around 1300 CE, and descendants of this cultural group probably include the modern Pueblo Indians now living in New Mexico and Arizona. The style is noted for fine baskets, pottery, cloth, ornaments, tools, and great architectural achievements, including cliff dwellings and apartment-house-like villages, or pueblos. In some classification schemes, the modern Pueblo cultures are considered later phases of this people, though most schemes end this culture with the abandonment of the cliff dwellings around 1300 CE.

Anasazi (Spanish, worth, U, U)

Avoid Use

Deprecated

Pejorative
Respect diverse points of view

Former preferred name is now flagged as ‘Pejorative’; squaw refers to a Native American female.
Respect diverse points of view

Reflect the indigenous people’s view if possible.

Use polyhierarchy, associative relationships, qualifiers, dates on names and relationships.

Defining the Issues

Do the current hierarchies reflect the indigenous people’s point of view? Often more complex than a simple hierarchy, with differences and relationships over time and territory.

How to remedy the situation? Can the repositories (museums) convene with experts and members of the communities to reach consensus?
Note: Whenever possible, use the specific tribal name. The term "Native American" is widely used in the United States, but many groups now prefer "American Indian" or "Indigenous American." And Aleuts. For the indigenous peoples of Canada use the term "First Nations." For the broader concept of the cultures of any native peoples of Central America, South America, North America, or the West Indies who are considered to belong to the Mongoloid division of the human species, use "Amerindian (culture)."

Terms:

- Native American (preferred, C,U,English-P,D,U,A)
- American Indian (C,U,English,UF,U,U)
- Indigenous American (C,U,English,UF,U,U)
- American, Native (C,U,English,UF,U,U)
- Indian, American (C,U,English,UF,U,U)
- Native Americans (C,U,English,UF,U,A)
- 美洲印第安人 (C,U,Chinese (traditional)-P,D,U,U)
Defining the Issues

ID: 300445549
Page Link: http://vocab.getty.edu/page/aat/300445549

chimalxopilli (insignia shields, <temporary alphabetical list: objects>)

Note: Nahua chimalli (shield) design of postclassic central Mexico featuring a tear-drop or paisley shape understood as a "toe" or "claw."

Toe-design shield

Hierarchical Position:
- Objects Facet
  - <temporary alphabetical list: objects> (G)
  - insignia shields (G,U)
  - chimalxopilli (G)

Additional Notes:
- Spanish ..... Diseño de chimalli (escudo) nahua que presenta una forma de lágrima o de cachemira, entendida como "dedo del pie" o "garra."
- Eastern Huasteca Nahuatl ..... Tlaixnextilli tlen chimalli nahua tlen quinextia quence ixxayotl zo tlen cachemira, huan mocuamachilia quence toicxopil zo mahtehteixquitic.
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to preferred terms:
Race, Ethnicity

May include terms for colonial, diaspora, etc. cultures

AAT

- Black (general, race and ethnicity)
  (race (group of people), culture-related concepts, ... Associated

- African American
  (modern North American, modern American, ... Styles and Periods (hier

- African Brazilian
  (modern Latin American, modern American, ... Styles and Periods

- Colonial African
  (African (general, continental cultures), <styles, periods, and other (hierarchy name)) [300108565]
  ................. Afro-Caribbean (culture and style)
  ................. Afro-Portuguese (culture and style)
  ................. Bini-Portuguese
  ................. Sapi-Portuguese
Defining the Issues

- It is important to provide appropriate, current terminology for indexing art, artists, etc.
- Current terminology is based on contributions and GVP research, warranted by current authoritative sources.

Be sensitive to preferred terms:
Gender identity, preferences

Note: Persons who gender-identify outside the male/female binary...

gender non-binary *(preferred, C,U,English-P)*

NB *(C,U,A,English,UF)*

enby *(C,U,N,English,UF)*

Top of the AAT hierarchies

.... Associated Concepts Facet
       ....... Associated Concepts (hierarchy name)
       ............ social science concepts
       ............ sociological concepts
       ............ gender identity
       ............ agender
       ............ bigender
       ............ dyadic
       ............ feminine
       ............ gender-fluid
       ............ gender-neutral
       ............ gender non-binary
       ............ genderqueer
       ............ intersex
       ............ masculine
       ............ pansexual
       ............ polysexual
       ............ questioning
       ............ two-spirit
Be sensitive to biased historical points of view.

Which is the preferred name? Is it the first chronologically, or the most recent? Which language?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Preferred Language Status</th>
<th>Preferred Language Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hagia Sophia</td>
<td>(preferred, Lang: English-pref, Status: loan term; Lang: German-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Αγία Σοφία</td>
<td>(Lang: Greek-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayasofya</td>
<td>(Lang: Turkish-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santa Sofia</td>
<td>(Lang: Spanish-pref; Lang: Italian-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayasofya-i Kebir Cami-i Şerifi</td>
<td>(Lang: Turkish-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayasofya Müzesi</td>
<td>(Lang: Turkish-pref)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

Which is the preferred name? Is it the first chronologically, or the most recent? Which language?

Which are the preferred work types?

Based on preponderance of practice in scholarly sources, this varies

---

**Hagia Sophia**

- church (building)
- mosque (building)
- museum (building)
- basilica (work by form)

**Note:**
- 532-ca.1453 Start: 532 End: 1455
- after 1453-1931; again from 2021 Start: 1453 End: 9999
- from 1935 Start: 1935 End: 9999

**Dates when Work Type apply**
**Defining the Issues**

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID: 7029527</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page Link: <a href="http://vocab.getty.edu/page/tgn/7029527">http://vocab.getty.edu/page/tgn/7029527</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Burrup Peninsula (peninsula)**

- **Coordinates:**
  - Lat: 20 33 30 S degrees minutes, Lat: -20.5583 decimal degrees
  - Long: 116 50 00 E degrees minutes, Long: 116.8333 decimal degrees

---

**Note:** Part of the Dampier archipelago, the Burrup Peninsula is noted as important cultural landscape that contains the world's largest and most important collection of petroglyphs. Some rock carvings have been dated to more than 45,000 years ago.

---

**Birrup Peninsula**


**Murujuga**

- **(Lang: Australian Aborig.-Pref Note: meaning 'hip bone sticking out' Start: 1000 End: 9999)**

**Dampier Peninsula**


---

**Place Types:**
- peninsula *(preferred)*
- archaeological site
- cultural landscape
- sacred site
- protected area

---

Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

Which should be the preferred name?
E.g., Aboriginal language, or English?

May change also due to historical view of the person for whom the place is named

Place Type: cultural and physical, archaeological. Sacred site. Which preferred?
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to biased historical points of view.

Respectfully describe and classify iconographical topics, e.g., deities.

Involve scholarly experts and/or members of the community referenced, if possible.

Top of the IA Hierarchies

- Legend, Religion, Mythology
- <Amerindian iconography>
- <Nahua iconography>
- <Nahua characters>
  - Huitzilopochtli (teotl, Nahua deity)
  - Mictecacihuatl (Nahua deity)
  - Tezcatlipoca (Nahua deity)
  - Tlahuizcalpantecutli (Nahua deity)
  - Tlaloc (Nahua deity)
  - Topiltzin Quetzalcoatl (Nahua character; Toltec character)
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

Respectfully describe and classify iconographical topics

What topics and links are included?

Note: Nahua deity associated with storms and rain. Represented with large round eyes or "goggles" and with pointed or curling elements at the mouth, sometimes interpreted as fangs. Related deities with similar iconography are found across Mesoamerica and from at least the 1st century BCE.

Tlaloc (Nahua deity) (preferred, English-P,D,N) (Eastern Huasteca Nahuatl-P,D,N) (Spanish-P,D,N) (Classical Nahuatl-P,D,N)

Totiotzin Tlaloc (Nahua deity) (Eastern Huasteca Nahuaahquez, tlatomonianih (Nahua deity) (Eastern Huasteca Nahuatl-P,D,N)

Related Iconography:
consort/spouse of ..., Chalchiuhtlicue
............(Legend, Religion, Mythology, Amerindian iconography, Aztec deity)) [901002066]

Other Relationships:
role/characteristic is .... deity
people in religion, people in religion and related occupation

Involve scholarly experts and/or members of the community referenced, if possible
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

migration
colonial memory
postcolonial memory
multivocality

Which name is preferred?

History written by former colonizers is different from the memories of the formerly colonized

Eerste Vryheidsoorlog (British-South African history, 1880-1881)

Note: War caused by the conflict between the British desire for colonial rule and the South African desire for independence. At stake were diamond and gold mines in the Transvaal.

Display Date: 1880-1881

Names:

First Boer War (British-South African history, 1880-1881)
First Boer War, First (British-South African history, 1880-1881)
First Boer War, the (British-South African history, 1880-1881)
Eerste Vryheidsoorlog (British-South African history, 1880-1881)
Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

Have documentation rules in place where possible

Avoid value judgement, unbiased, neutral

Difficult because often sources are not neutral; cataloger must beware

---

Defining the Issues

From Getty Vocabulary guidelines

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/guidelines/aat_3_4_scope_note.html#3_4_1

3.4.1.5.11

Be objective

Avoid bias or judgment. Express information in a neutral tone...

- People, events, art works
  Do not express biased views about rulers, other people, art, architecture, or events. That is, do not express views that are subjectively negative; likewise, do not express positive information in a subjective way. Instead, state views that are held by the scholarly or professional community in an objective way.

- Controversial subjects
  When referring to a disputed or controversial matter, remain perfectly neutral, giving equal emphasis to both points of view.

- Religious and cultural biases
  Avoid using language that expresses biased views about religion or religious groups. Do not state or imply negative or Western-centric views about native peoples.

- Avoid using terminology for that may be considered offensive by groups of people. For example, when speaking of the indigenous populations of the Americas in the scope note, do not use the term "Indian," which is offensive and also ambiguous, since it more correctly refers to the people of the subcontinent of India, but instead use the name of the tribes. If you don't know the name of the tribe or need to speak in general terms, use "Native American," "Amerindian" (where appropriate), or "First Nations" (where appropriate).
Be sensitive to biased historical points of view

Nationalities and nations’ names are perceived differently by different audiences

Index both points of view if in authoritative sources; which is preferred? Nationality or culture, as person self-identifies if possible

Nation changed during person’s lifetime (Yugoslavia 1918-1941, 1945-1992)

Defining the Issues

Names:
Musovik, Oliver
Oliver Musovik
(preferred, V, index, Dutch-P, English-P)
(V, index, Dutch, English)

Nationalities:
Macedonian (North Macedonian) (preferred)
Yugoslavian

Birth and Death Places:
Born: Skopje (Skopje, Severna Makedonija) (inhabited place)

Biographies:
[Macedonian photographer and installation artist, born 1971]
(artist, active 20th century) ..... [GRISC]
(Yugoslav artist) ..... [RKD]

Sources and Contributors:
Musovik, Oliver ..... [GRISC Preferred, RKD Preferred]
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to biased current or historical points of view.

How to represent status of disputed territories? Historical jurisdictions? E.g., de jure sovereign state.

Use polyhierarchy to represent multiple points of view.

TGN
Be sensitive to biased current or historical points of view

How to represent overlapping jurisdictions. E.g., Indian Nations within United States

---

**Defining the Issues**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top of the TGN hierarchy (hierarchy root)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.... World (facet)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>........ North and Central America (continent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>............ United States (nation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>............ Navajo Nation (tribal nation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>............ Chinle Agency (administrative division)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Blue Gap (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Chinle (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Cottonwood (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Lukachukai (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Many Farms (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Nazlini (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Pinon (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Rough Rock (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Salina (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Tsaile (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>................ Wheatfields (inhabited place) [N]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Defining the Issues

Be sensitive to biased current or historical points of view.

Use polyhierarchy, here to represent place’s relationship to USA and to Navajo Nation.
Defining the Issues

Acknowledge various cultural traditions

Names and naming traditions are respected

E.g., Art names for name as artist, Adult name for name conferred at adulthood, Changed name could be for transgender, etc.

Katsushika Hokusai (Japanese printmaker, painter, 1760-1849)

Note: Noted for works of ukiyo-e ('pictures of the floating world') in painting and printmaking. He had a long career of over 70 years during which, he adopted over 30 names, typically associated with shifts in production and style. He studied Ming painting in China, the Kanō school, Sumiyoshi school, Rinpā painting, and his contemporaries of the Edo period in Japan; he also learned from Western-style painting. Types of works included nikuhitsu-ga (polychrome or ink paintings); surimono ('printed things'; small-edition woodblock prints); and nishiki-e (polychrome prints), woodblocks for eirin (Illustrated books), kyōka-e (Illustrated books of poems), and printed book illustrations. He was one of the main shunga (erotic picture) artists of the Edo period. Hokusai is thought to have created over 30,000 drawings and illustrations for 500 books. Since the late 19th century, his work has had a significant impact on Western artists, including Gauguin and van Gogh.

Names:
- Katsushika Hokusai (preferred, V.display)
- Hokusai Katsushika (V,index)
- Katsushika, Hokusai (VLC)
- Hokusai (VCN)
- 葛飾 北斎 (V,Japanese,NA,U)
- Shunrō (V)

Sōri — gō (artist's name), used in early career, name taken from his Rinpa-school master Tawaraya Sōri

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/guidelines/ulan_3_3_names_terms.html#3_3_21
Could including names, roles, locations, sex/gender, relationships be considered an invasion of the person’s privacy?
Defining the Issues

Respect personal privacy balanced, with critical ability to research.

When is it appropriate to include information about recent or living people?

Open issue: When it is established in reliable published sources that they so self-identify?

Privacy is paramount.

But to eliminate knowledge is to deny research (e.g., female artists, African American artists, etc.)

An artist’s oeuvre may be influenced by or publicly focused on their own gender identity or sexual preference.

If we include this data, are sources reliable?

* nationality, culture, ethnicity, race, religion, sexual identity, or sexual orientation
Defining the Issues

Contrary to the mission of LOC, Getty Vocabularies are rich resources intended to facilitate complex research and discovery; they are not just "value vocabulary" authorities but include contextual information.

Respect personal privacy, balanced with critical ability to research.

Unlike mission of LOC, Getty Vocabularies include rich contextual information to allow research and discovery.

Revised Report on Recording Gender in Personal Name Authority Records
PCC Ad Hoc Task Group on Recording Gender in Personal Name Authority Records
April 7, 2022

Recommendation for Personal Name Authorities

Do not record the RDA gender element (MARC 375) in personal name authority records. Delete existing 375 fields when editing a record for any other reason.

Proposed revisions to relevant LC-PCC documentation (including DCM Z1, LC-PCC PS, LC-PCC Metadata Guidance Document, LC Guidelines Supplement to the MARC 21 Format for Authority Data, and the NACO Participants' Manual) can be found in the appendices to this report.

- The primary goal of authority data is for disambiguation, not contextual biographical information.
Defining the Issues

- For Getty Vocabularies, what is meaning of Accessibility and Inclusivity?
- Usual definition entails combining accessibility standards and usability to ensure that physical spaces and Web design are usable by people with disabilities (physical, cognitive)
- For Vocabs, this would include legibility of Web site
  - Large enough, clear fonts, contrast with background, braille, audibles, etc.
  - Ease of use of Web and tools for multiple audiences
- Expand this to include various other slices of audiences
  - Regardless of money, advanced technology, technical expertise
  - Regardless of culture and language differences
  - Regardless of intention – scholarly research, casually interested user, and technical developers
- Making Vocabs online, guidelines and training, data formats, tools, and contributions accessible
- Use redundancy in addition to primary entry point – specialist vs public vs developer
Defining the Issues

- Accessibility vs dumbing down
- To reach audiences without advanced technology
  - Supply data files in older formats
  - Create data sets and use cases for various audiences
  - Content should be understandable, explain jargon
  - Present online records in different ways, attractive and usable, allowing deeper dives into details
- Contributors still should be experts, but make process more open and accessible
- Provide more technical support and help if possible
  - Does budget and mission support this?
- Why does it matter to make Getty Vocabularies’ presentations of the data more accessible and inclusive?
  - It's the right thing to do
  - Positive returns on investment (ROI), repeat visitation, audience demographics, audience reach
- Ensure content and data formats remain relevant as technology races ahead
  - How do we ensure developers give access to rich data?
  - Open data means we advise which data is critical (sources and contributors? preferences?), but we cannot enforce developers using it
Getty Vocabularies: The Future
Future of Getty Vocabularies

Multilingual  Multicultural  Diversity  Inclusive  Equity  Unbiased  Antiracist  Accessible

 Getty Vocabularies: the Future

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/

• Reimagine how to commit to make AAT, TGN, ULAN, CONA, and IA ever more multilingual, multicultural, and inclusive, focusing also on diversity, equity, unbiased and antiracist terminology, and accessibility

• Working within our defined domains (see Scope descriptions for AAT, TGN, ULAN, CONA, IA), nurture relationships with our established community and reach out to new partners and opportunities

• Plan development for three audiences: scholarly research, casual interested persons, developers

• Facilitate contributions that are more targeted vs opportunistic
  • Continue seeking contributions that focus on our core mission
• Explore methods to aid contributors in pre-processing, training, tools (e.g., OpenRefine, workshops, tutorials)
• Integrate and link Vocabularies in metadata at GRI and across Getty
• Make proof-of-concept models using Vocabularies in metadata resources to provide serious research and discovery
• Create co-referencing of overlapping, similar resources; multiple IDs
• Publication will remain Open and Free of charge (LOD, and all formats)
• Simplify where possible, but strive to maintain rich, complex data model that allows for serious research and discovery
• Work on formats for export and integration in other resources
  • Currently released online search, LOD, XML, Rel Tables, APIs
  • New versions that are advanced, useful to emerging technology
  • But we cannot exclude users who are not wealthy or without elite technical support; strive to continue needed formats
Thank you.

Patricia Harpring
Managing Editor
 Getty Vocabulary Program

pharpring@getty.edu
vocab@getty.edu

https://www.getty.edu/research/tools/vocabularies/