The Second International Conference on the Conservation of Grotto Sites, Mogao Grottoes, Dunhuang, People's Republic of China, June 28–July 3, 2004 PROCEEDINGS

Conservation of Ancient Sites on the Silk Road

Edited by Neville Agnew

Conservation of Ancient Sites on the Silk Road

# Conservation of Ancient Sites on the Silk Road

Proceedings of the Second International Conference on the Conservation of Grotto Sites, Mogao Grottoes, Dunhuang, People's Republic of China, June 28–July 3, 2004

Edited by Neville Agnew

THE GETTY CONSERVATION INSTITUTE LOS ANGELES

#### Getty Conservation Institute

Timothy P. Whalen, *Director* Jeanne Marie Teutonico, *Associate Director, Programs* 

The Getty Conservation Institute works internationally to advance conservation and to enhance and encourage the preservation and understanding of the visual arts in all of their dimensions—objects, collections, architecture, and sites. The Institute serves the conservation community through scientific research; education and training; field projects; and the dissemination of the results of both its work and the work of others in the field. In all its endeavors, the Institute is committed to addressing unanswered questions and promoting the highest possible standards of conservation practice.

Getty Publications 1200 Getty Center Drive, Suite 500 Los Angeles, California 90049-1682 www.getty.edu

© 2010 J. Paul Getty Trust

Gregory M. Britton, Publisher

Tevvy Ball, *Editor* Sheila Berg, *Copy Editor* Hespenheide Design, *Designer* Elizabeth Zozom, *Production Coordinator* 

Printed in China at Everbest Printing Company through Four Colour Print Group

FRONT COVER: Portrait of a donor, from cave 85 (corridor, south wall), Mogao Grottoes. Photo by Lorinda Wong

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Conservation of ancient sites on the Silk Road : proceedings of the second international conference on the conservation of grotto sites, Mogao Grottoes, Dunhuang, People's Republic of China, June 28–July 3, 2004 / edited by Neville Agnew.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-60606-013-1 (pbk.)

 Mural painting and decoration, Chinese—Conservation and restoration—China— Dunhuang Caves—Congresses. 2. Buddhist art—Conservation and restoration—China— Dunhuang Caves—Congresses. 3. Buddhist cave temples—China—Dunhuang Caves— Conservation and restoration—Congresses. 4. Dunhuang Caves (China)—Antiquities— Congresses. 5. Cave paintings—Conservation and restoration—Congresses. 6. Cultural property—Protection—Congresses. I. Agnew, Neville, 1938-

ND2849.T86A53 2010

751.7'30095145—dc22

## Contents

Tim Whalen	xi	Foreword
Neville Agnew	xii	Preface
Neville Agnew	xiv	Acknowledgments
	xvi	Site Map of the Mogao Grottoes
	xvii	Map of the Silk Road
	xviii	China Dynasty Table
		Keynote Presentations
Fan Jinshi	3	Master Plan for the Conservation and Management of the Mogao Grottoes: Preparation and Achievements
Sharon Sullivan	8	Managing Cultural Heritage Sites: Some Parameters for Success
Zhang Wenbin	19	China's Policy in Relation to International Exchange and Cooperation in Cultural Heritage Conservation in China
Sharon Cather	22	Choices and Judgment: The Professional Conservator at the Interface

		PART ONE International Collaboration
Du Xiaofan, translated by Naomi Hellmann	35	UNESCO Support for Cultural Heritage Conservation in China
Huang Kezhong	41	International Cooperation for the Protection of China's Cultural Heritage
Li Zuixiong	46	Deterioration and Treatment of Wall Paintings in Grottoes along the Silk Road in China and Related Conservation Efforts
Laurent Lévi-Strauss and Roland Lin	56	Safeguarding Silk Road Sites in Central Asia
Ron van Oers	62	Nomination of the Silk Road in China to UNESCO's World Heritage List: Proposals for a Strategic Approach and Reference Framework for Heritage Routes
		PART TWO POlicy and Principles
Jin Hongkui	75	The Content and Theoretical Significance of the <i>Principles for the Conservation of Heritage Sites in China</i>
Jean-Louis Luxen	85	The Principles for the Conservation of Heritage Sites in China—A Critique
Zhang Lizhu	88	The Role of Hebei Province in Developing and Implementing the China Principles
		PART THREE History and Silk Road Studies
Susan Whitfield	95	A Place of Safekeeping? The Vicissitudes of the Bezeklik Murals
John Falconer	107	Perspectives on Photography's Contribution to Archaeology in Central Asia
Bo Lawergren	117	Harps on the Ancient Silk Road
Fred H. Martinson	125	Stein and Trinkler on the Rawak Vihara: A Mandala Style Moves East

### PART FOUR Planning and Management

Ludmila Akmatova and Jumamedel Imankulov	135	Conservation and Management of Cultural Heritage Sites on the Silk Road in Kyrgyzstan
Li Ping, Sharon Sullivan, Kirsty Altenburg, and Peter Barker	143	Visitor Surveys at Mogao: Pioneering the Process, 2002–2004
Kirsty Altenburg, Sharon Sullivan, Li Ping, and Peter Barker	152	The Challenge of Managing Visitors at the Mogao Grottoes
Martha Demas, Shin Maekawa, Jonathan Bell, and Neville Agnew	160	Sustainable Visitation at the Mogao Grottoes: A Methodology for Visitor Carrying Capacity
Rickard Mackay	170	Social and Environmental Monitoring as a Tool for Managing Visitor Impact at Jenolan Caves, Australia
		PART FIVE Scientific Research
Henri Van Damme, Mokhtar Zabat, Jean-Paul Laurent, Patrick Dudoignon, Anne Pantet, David Gélard, and Hugo Houben	181	Nature and Distribution of Cohesion Forces in Earthen Building Materials
Chikaosa Tanimoto, Chunze Piao, Keigo Koizumi, Shuichi Iwata, Tadashi Masuya, Li Zuixiong, Wang Xudong, and Guo Qinglin	189	Geology and Hydrogeology at the Mogao Grottoes, Dunhuang
Huang Jizhong	196	The Influence of Water on the Stone Carvings of the Yungang Grottoes
Catharina Blaensdorf and Ma Tao	203	A Chinese-German Cooperative Project for the Preservation of the Cultural Heritage of Shaanxi Province: Conservation of the Polychrome Clay Sculpture and Investigation of Painting Materials in the Great Hall of the Shuilu'an Buddhist Temple
Daniela Bathelt and Heinz Langhals	213	Two Methods for the Conservation of the Polychromy of the Terracotta Army of Qin Shihuang: Electron Beam Polymerization of Methacrylic Monomers and Consolidation Using Polyethylene Glycol

Sandra Bucher and Xia Yin	218	The Stone Armor from the Burial Complex of Qin Shihuang in Lintong, China: Methodology for Excavation, Restoration, and Conservation, including the Use of Cyclododecane, a Volatile Temporary Consolidant
Heinz Berke, Armin Portmann, Soraya Bouherour, Ferdinand Wild, Ma Qinglin, and Hans-Georg Wiedemann	225	The Development of Ancient Synthetic Copper- Based Blue and Purple Pigments
Pamela B. Vandiver, Amy Vandiver, Akbar Rakhimov, and Alisher Rakhimov	234	Ishkor Glazes of Uzbekistan
		PART SIX Examination and Documentation Techniques
Lu Dongming, Liu Gang, Liu Yang, and Diao Changyu	251	Digital Acquisition, Reconstruction, and Virtual Interpretation of Dunhuang Murals
Harlan Wallach	259	High-Resolution Photography at the Dunhuang Grottoes: Northwestern University's Role in the Mellon International Dunhuang Archive
Pan Yunhe, Fan Jinshi, and Li Zuixiong	262	Dunhuang Grottoes Conservation and Computer Technologies
Haida Liang, David Saunders, John Cupitt, and Christian Lahanier	267	Multispectral Imaging for Easel and Wall Paintings
Rocco Mazzeo, Edith Joseph, Silvia Prati, Ma Tao, Gwénaelle Gautier, and Lucien M. van Valen	275	Scientific Examination of the Traditional Materials and Techniques Used in Yuan Dynasty Wall Paintings
Sanjay Dhar	286	Documentation and Emergency Treatment of Wall Paintings in the Chamba Lakhang (Maitreya Temple): Developing a Methodology to Conserve Mural Paintings in India's Ladakh District
Kathleen M. Garland	297	Surveying Paradise: The Conservation Survey of a Yuan Dynasty Wall Painting on a Clay Base
Zhong Shihang and Huang Kezhong	304	Determining the Internal Condition of the Leshan Buddha Statue

#### PART SEVEN Methods and Treatment

Guo Hong, Han Rubin, Huang Huaiwu, Lan Riyong, and Xie Riwan	311	Types of Weathering of the Huashan Rock Paintings
Ma Qinglin, Chen Genling, Lu Yanling, and Li Zuixiong	316	A Study of Support Materials for Mural Paintings in Humid Environments
Du Xiaoli, translated by Naomi Hellmann	324	Study and Conservation of the Dazhao Temple Wall Painting, Inner Mongolia
Yang Mangmang and Zhang Yongjian	331	Pigment Analysis and Environmental Monitoring of Murals in the Tang Dynasty Huiling Mausoleum
Sekhar Chandra Set	336	Indian Wall Paintings: Analysis of Materials and Techniques
Tie Fude	343	Conservation of Mural Paintings Transferred from a Royal Mausoleum of the Western Han Dynasty at Shiyuan, Henan Province
		PART EIGHT
		Consolidation and Stabilization
Wang Xudong, Li Zuixiong, and Zhang Lu	351	Condition, Conservation, and Reinforcement of the Yumen Pass and Hecang Earthen Ruins near Dunhuang
Wang Wanfu, Wang Tao, Zhang Weimin, Li Zuixiong, Wang Xudong, Zhang Guobing, Qiu Fei, and Du Mingyuan	358	Research and Application Methods for Comprehensive Control of Wind-Borne Sand at the Mogao Grottoes
Sun Yihua, Wang Wanfu, and Fu Qingyuan	365	Restoration and Consolidation of Historic Earthen Structures: The Upper and Middle Temple Complexes at the Mogao Grottoes
He Ling, Jiang Baolian, Zhou Weiqiang, and Zhen Gang	370	Consolidation Studies on Sandstone in the Zhongshan Grotto
Zhou Shuanglin, Yuan Sixun, Guo Baofa, and Xia Yin	380	Nonaqueous Dispersions and Their Antiweathering Performance for Earthen Buildings, Monuments, and Archaeological Sites
Zhang Zhijun	385	Consolidation Methods for Cracks at the Qin Terracotta Army Earthen Site
Wang Hui	389	The Conservation Program for the Castle Ruins of the Guge Kingdom in Ali, Tibet

#### PART NINE

### Mogao Grottoes Cave 85 Project

Neville Agnew and Li Zuixiong	397	Objectives of the Cave 85 Project
Wang Jinyu	399	The Significance of Cave 85
Xu Shuqing, Wang Xiaowei, Sun Hongcai, Li Weitang, Francesca Piqué, Lorinda Wong, Leslie Rainer, Li Yunhe, and Zheng Jun	406	Conservation History and Condition Survey of Cave 85, Mogao Grottoes
Neville Agnew, Shin Maekawa, and Shuya Wei	412	Causes and Mechanisms of Deterioration and Damage in Cave 85
Francesca Piqué, Lorinda Wong, and Su Bomin	421	Methodology for the Conservation of the Wall Paintings in Cave 85
Lisa Shekede, Fan Zaixuan, Francesca Piqué, and Lorinda Wong	430	The Role of In Situ Examination in the Technical Investigation of the Cave 85 Paintings
Michael R. Schilling, Joy Mazurek, David Carson, Su Bomin, Fan Yuquan, and Ma Zanfeng	438	Analytical Research in Cave 85
Cecily M. Grzywacz, Jan Wouters, Su Bomin, and Fan Yuquan	450	Asian Organic Colorants: A Collaborative Research Project
James R. Druzik	457	Evaluating the Light Sensitivity of Paints in Selected Wall Paintings at the Mogao Grottoes: Caves 217, 98, and 85
Shin Maekawa, Liu Gang, Xue Ping, Guo Qinglin, and Hou Wenfang	464	Origins of Moisture Affecting the Wall Paintings in Cave 85
Stephen Rickerby, Lisa Shekede, Fan Zaixuan, Tang Wei, Qiao Hai, Yang Jinjian, and Francesca Piqué	471	Development and Testing of the Grouting and Soluble-Salts Reduction Treatments of Cave 85 Wall Paintings
Stephen Rickerby, Lisa Shekede, Fan Zaixuan, Tang Wei, Qiao Hai, and Yang Jinjian	480	Implementation of Grouting and Salts-Reduction Treatments of Cave 85 Wall Paintings
Chen Gangquan, Michael R. Schilling, Li Yanfei, Joy Mazurek, Yu Zhongren, and Lisa Shekede	488	A Rapid Means of Measuring Residual Salt after Grouting and Poulticing Wall Paintings
Lorinda Wong, Francesca Piqué, Wang Xiaowei, and Xu Shuqing	494	The Information Management System for the Cave 85 Project
	502	Contributors

### Foreword

The Getty Conservation Institute and the Dunhuang Academy, with the endorsement of China's State Administration of Cultural Heritage (SACH), have traveled a long road together, one that began in January 1989 with a formal agreement between the institutions concerned. Since that time, our collaborative activities have included the first Silk Road conference, "Conservation of Ancient Sites on the Silk Road," held in 1993; development of China ICOMOS's "Principles for the Conservation of Heritage Sites in China"; a multiyear wall painting conservation project at the Mogao grottoes; a master's degree course in wall painting conservation, collaboratively organized with the Dunhuang Academy, Lanzhou University, and the Courtauld Institute of Art; and a visitor management and carrying-capacity plan for the fragile cave temples at Mogao.

It therefore gives me great pleasure to write the foreword to this publication of the papers from the second Silk Road conference, held at the Mogao grottoes in 2004. There has been a rich and dynamic interchange of expertise between SACH, the Dunhuang Academy, and the GCI over the two decades of our collaboration. SACH and the Dunhuang Academy have also generously provided resources that have advanced our ability to work in China. Reciprocally, the GCI has hosted visiting staff from both organizations, including participation in some of the GCI's other overseas activities, such as the Queens Valley project in Egypt.

Since the first Silk Road conference was held, an important aspect of our collaborative work has centered on wall painting conservation, with focus on cave 85 at the Mogao site, a splendid cave temple dating from the late Tang dynasty. This work is summarized in these conference proceedings as a series of papers, intended to establish a methodological yardstick for future research and conservation treatment of the extraordinarily beautiful—yet threatened and delicate—paintings and polychrome sculpture at Mogao and other, similar Silk Road sites.

Lest anyone imagine otherwise, it is not always easy working and collaborating across barriers of language and culture. What is the "glue" that holds together a partnership such as the one that we have enjoyed with our partners in China? Succinctly stated, it is a combination of clearly defined roles and responsibilities, and common objectives. For his work on this volume and his decades-long leadership of the GCI's work in China, I thank Neville Agnew, whose extraordinary professionalism and dedication have been central to our successful partnerships in China. I am most grateful to Fan Jinshi, director of the Dunhuang Academy, and Zhang Bai, deputy director of SACH, for their lasting friendship and commitment to the conservation of China's remarkable heritage. They have been instrumental in making the GCI-China partnership the longest enduring collaboration of the Getty Conservation Institute. Now in the midst of our seventh three-year agreement with SACH at the Dunhuang Academy, we look forward to new challenges, as new opportunities beckon in our future work together.

> Тімотну Р. Whalen Director The Getty Conservation Institute

### Preface

I ince the first Silk Road conference was held at the Mogao Grottoes in 1993, great changes have taken placefirst, new construction and better facilities for visitors and personnel; and second, the professional development of Dunhuang Academy conservation staff. The site has become more accessible with expansion of the local airport, and visitor numbers have increased, at times beyond the capacity of management to cope. Mogao has continued to attract scholars who study the iconography of the wall paintings and statuary and the ancient documents from the famed Library Cave; it has developed expertise in site conservation, management, and presentation; and it has become recognized as a center of excellence in China. This has not been without some cost to the site, however, as greater burden has been placed on staff through demands for the expertise of the Dunhuang Academy to assist less-well-established organizations elsewhere in China in conserving their sites. Perforce, the Dunhuang Academy has had to divert some of its own fully extended personnel to undertake conservation projects elsewhere in China and in other Asian countries as well while serving in an advisory role to a number of national initiatives in conservation. Balancing these requests with the many urgent needs of the Mogao Grottoes and the two other sites, Yulin and the Western Grottoes, under the Dunhuang Academy's management and conservation jurisdiction has been no easy matter. Fortunately, Director Fan Jinshi, whose life has been devoted to the site, has kept an unclouded vision and maintained her priorities for Mogao.

This publication, an outcome of the Second International Conference on the Conservation of Grotto Sites, has appeared more than a decade after the first. While the first conference essentially focused on managerial and technical conservation, the scope of the second was expanded to include art historical and related topics, though, as can be seen in the table of contents, the emphasis has remained primarily conservation. The purpose of addressing a larger subject matter has been to seek greater inclusivity and to build bridges between conservation and scholarly research on the history of the Mogao Grottoes and the Silk Road in its vast geographic reach. Moreover, because Mogao is a site in the top echelon of significance among China's extensive list of World Heritage Sites and a pivotal one along the ancient Silk Road trade routes, it was thought important in the spirit of exchange between East and West to seek participation from other central Asian countries. This was not entirely successful, but the gesture was made; Kyrgyzstan delegates participated in the event, and Uzbekistan contributors submitted their papers, which are included in this publication.

As stated in the preface to the first Silk Road conference proceedings, the collaboration between the Dunhuang Academy and the Getty Conservation Institute addressed broad site-wide issues of conservation at Mogao. In the present volume the work undertaken since the first conference is presented. These joint efforts reflect, we believe, the far greater synergy that can be generated when partners work together in mutual trust and understanding on problems and issues of common interest.

Looking back, both sides embarked together on ambitious undertakings that include, with the support of the State Administration of Cultural Heritage of China, participation in developing the *Principles for the Conservation of Heritage Sites in China* in partnership with the Australian Heritage Commission; drafting a master plan for the site; research, testing, and conservation of cave 85; and initiation of a master's degree course in the conservation of wall paintings through a four-way partnership between Lanzhou University (the degree-conferring institution), the Dunhuang Academy, the Courtauld Institute of Art in London, and the Getty Conservation Institute.

Areas of acute need identified in the master plan were also addressed, including a use plan, a visitor management subplan, and a visitor carrying capacity study for the cave temples open to the public. Visitation to the site and increasing visitor numbers represent a dire threat. Unless a cap on visitor numbers, backed by sound research, is implemented as a policy of the Dunhuang Academy, the site will be degraded by overuse and commercial pressures. Translation between Chinese and English, as always, proved a challenge: both languages, of course, have subtleties and nuances that tax the most expert of translators. Add to these the specialized terminology of conservation, scientific and technical terms, and geographic place-names—to mention but a few—and the problem is compounded.

Many colleagues have striven greatly, as acknowledged elsewhere, to bring this long-delayed publication to fruition. We hope it may prove of value well beyond the confines of the Mogao Grottoes.

NEVILLE AGNEW

## Acknowledgments

The Second International Conference on the Conservation of Grotto Sites was a collaborative undertaking of the Getty Conservation Institute and the Dunhuang Academy, with the approval of China's State Administration of Cultural Heritage. The director of the Dunhuang Academy, Fan Jinshi, was an enthusiastic proponent of the event from the first, as was Tong Mingkang, deputy director of the State Administration. Timothy P. Whalen, director of the GCI, likewise endorsed the suggestion of a second conference as a milestone in these institutions' long-standing joint conservation and management planning efforts at the Mogao Grottoes.

It is appropriate to recognize the work of Su Bomin, at the Dunhuang Academy, who undertook arrangements on the Chinese side, and Kathleen Louw, at the GCI, who provided efficient logistical and planning support. Preparation of the manuscript for publication of the proceedings has been a collaborative effort of many colleagues, though an onerous one. Special thanks are due to Elizabeth Maggio, who coedited many of the papers and whose exacting standard has set the tone for the volume. Foremost among the many difficulties has been the challenge of translation from the Chinese. It is not the editor's purpose here to recount the tribulations of attempting to wrestle with the often-inscrutable English in some of the translations that were submitted, or to comment, other than in passing, on manuscripts with incomplete or missing references, but rather to gratefully express appreciation for the unstinting help of colleagues. Po-Ming Lin should be acknowledged first; it was he who spent countless hours on the telephone and via email communicating with authors in an attempt to clarify points of meaning. His was the patience of Job. Peter Barker likewise was generous with his time and perseverance in attempting to unravel the often highly technical language and terminology. Po-Ming and Peter worked together, consulting with each other and frequently seeking clarification from other Chinese speakers at the Getty Conservation Institute, notably Ye Wa and Zhang Liangren, when their expertise was relevant to the subject matter. Jonathan Bell reviewed certain papers and clarified Buddhist terminology in cases where transliteration from the Chinese resulted in inconsistency with commonly recognized English translation (usually based on the Sanskrit term), Lorinda Wong assisted with a number of papers on wall painting conservation, and Martha Demas repeatedly provided useful counsel on matters of content. In the final throes of editing, Valerie Greathouse and Cameron Trowbridge of the GCI's Information Center reviewed bibliographic citations, completing some, finding others; the institute is fortunate in having staff who, undaunted, tackle such tasks with humor and a sense of challenge. An immense debt of gratitude is due to them.

Getty Publications has been forbearing in the long, often-stalled editorial process, and we are indebted also to Tevvy Ball, Sheila Berg, and Ann Lucke for their patience and their meticulous standards in the handling and copyediting of the manuscript. As always, the designers at Getty Publications have produced an elegant volume appropriate to the art of the site.

Beverly Weisblatt handled the manuscript flow and tracked versions as they were transmitted back and forth between the editors and the authors; her help was essential throughout the process. Cynthia Godlewski managed efficiently, and with her characteristic tact, all communication and transmission of the final manuscripts to Getty Publications for copyediting, design, and production.

To all of the above we are most grateful.

To those authors who submitted in a timely manner and whose manuscripts were complete and intelligible, we

apologize for the delay in seeing the work in print; we hope, despite the protracted process, that this volume will prove to have been worth the wait.

NEVILLE AGNEW



Mogao satellite image. Satellite image courtesy of Digital Globe. Inset photo by G. Aldana © J. Paul Getty Trust



#### China Dynasty Table

China Dynasty Table	
Xia	ca. 21st century-16th century B.C.E.
Shang	ca. 16th century–11th century B.C.E.
Western Zhou	ca. 11th century–770 в.с.е.
Eastern Zhou	
Spring and Autumn Period	770-476 в.с.е.
Warring States Period	475-221 в.с.е.
Qin	221-207 в.с.е.
Western Han	206 b.c.e24 c.e.
Eastern Han	25-220
Three Kingdoms	220-280
Wei	220–265
Shu	221–263
Wu	222-280
Western Jin	265-316
Eastern Jin	317-420
Southern and Northern Dynasties	420-589
Sui	589-618
Tang	618–907
Five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms	907–979
Song	960-1279
Northern Song	960–1127
Southern Song	1127–1279
Liao	916-1125
Jin	1115–1234
Yuan	1271–1368
Ming	1368–1644
Qing	1644–1911
Republic of China	1912–1949
People's Republic of China	1949-present